PHILADELPHIA CITY PLANNING COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES FOR MARCH 20, 2018

PRESENT:

Anne Fadullon, Commission Chair
Joseph Syrnick, Vice Chair
Garlen Capita
Patrick Eiding
Cheryl L. Gaston
Maria Gonzalez
Nancy Rogo Trainer
Ariel Vazquez
Duane Bumb, Representing Harold T. Epps
Peilin Chen, Representing Rob Dubow
Christopher Rupe, Representing Michael DiBerardinis
Eleanor L. Sharpe, Executive Director

NOT PRESENT:
Commission Chair, Anne Fadullon convened the Philadelphia City Planning Commission meeting on Tuesday, March 20, 2018, at 1:01 p.m.

1. **Approval of the Meeting Minutes for February 20th and February 27, 2018.**
   
   Upon the motion made by Commissioner Eiding, seconded by Commissioner Gaston, the City Planning Commission voted to approve the meeting minutes for February 20th and February 27, 2018.

2. **Executive Director’s Update**

   We would like to announce our staff award for the quarter which goes to Heather Strassberger – our community health planner.

   Heather joined the Commission a little over two years ago. As a member of the North District Planning team throughout the process, Heather dedicated a tremendous amount of time on Spanish translation for the project. Although we hired Heather as our community health coordinator and not for knowledge of Spanish, her contribution was invaluable. She helped with translating written documents for the steering and public meetings, assisted with interpretation at the meetings, researched translations of various planning terms and worked on the final translation of the plan – all of this over and above her typical work on a district plan. We had many volunteers from various groups to help with translation and hired a translator for the final document, we are very grateful that we had our in-house ace and could not have done the project without her guidance throughout the process. For going above and beyond, we recognize her for her significant contribution to the work of the Commission.

**PHILADELPHIA2035 PUBLIC MEETING**

The second public meeting of the Upper Northwest District Plan Meeting is scheduled for next week on March 26 at Germantown Friends School.

Reminder that the deadline for public comment for West Philadelphia is also next week by March 30th. The Plan would be adopted in April.

**HPTF PUBLIC MEETING**

The Historic Preservation Task Force held a public meeting last week on March 15th. The next public meeting will be sometime in May and we will let you know the exact date and time.

**PCPC AND CDR MEETING UPDATE**

   Next scheduled CDR meeting: Tuesday April 3, 2018 at 1:00 p.m.
   Next scheduled PCPC meeting: Tuesday April 17, 2018 at 1:00 p.m.

A reminder that anyone interested in applying to our **CITIZENS PLANNING INSTITUTE**, the **deadline for the upcoming Spring cohort is this Wednesday March 21st**.
Please feel free to apply on the Citizens Planning Institute website starting tomorrow - February 21st until March 21st or call 215-683-4648 for a print application. Classes will begin April 11th and run until May 23, 2018 once a week on Wednesdays 6-9pm.

The cost is $100, which includes dinner and scholarships are available.

**LEGISLATIVE BILL(S) RECOMMENDED FOR ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVAL**

We have several Legislative Bills recommended for administrative approval, as they are consistent with previous policies of the Commission.

1. Bill No. 180097: “An Ordinance to amend the Master Plan for the University of Pennsylvania, and to approve the proposed addition to 3620 Locust Walk.” Introduced by Councilmember Blackwell on February 15, 2018.

2. Bill No. 180105: “An Ordinance authorizing the Commissioner of Public Property to convey, to the Philadelphia Authority for Industrial Development, certain parcels of land situate at 3300 North Front Street, with any improvements thereon, for further conveyance, all under certain terms and conditions.” Introduced by Councilmember Quiñones Sánchez on February 15, 2018.

3. Bill No. 180136: “An Ordinance amending Section 2 of an Ordinance (Bill No. 140902) approved March 4, 2015, entitled ‘An Ordinance authorizing the revision of lines and grades on a portion of City Plan Nos. 224 and 232 by striking from the City Plan and vacating Cayuga Street from Whitaker Avenue to its terminus eastwardly therefrom and reserving and placing on the City Plan a right-of-way for sewer and drainage purposes within the lines of Cayuga Street being stricken and authorizing acceptance of the grant to the City of the said right-of-way, under certain terms and conditions,’ by extending the period for compliance with the terms and conditions stated therein.” Introduced by Councilmember Quiñones Sánchez on February 22, 2018. This Bill is for an extension of time for a previously approved Bill.


Staff also recommends the following PRA items for approval:

1. Amendment to the North Philadelphia Redevelopment Area Plan to change the Proposed Land Use for 3103 Cecil B. Moore Avenue from ‘Residential and Related’ to ‘Commercial and Related’, consistent with the City Planning Commission vote in May 2017 to approve the redevelopment agreement for 3101-3103 Cecil B. Moore Avenue.

2. Review and approval of changes proposed by the PRA to two Urban Renewal Areas (URA). The changes update references to agency names, delete outdated design and construction standards, and add reference to general consistency with the City’s comprehensive plan.

   a) Cecil B. Moore URA - 15th Amended Redevelopment Proposal and Urban Renewal Plan
b) Model Cities URA – 41st Amended Redevelopment Proposal and 33rd Amended Urban Renewal Plan

3. Redevelopment agreement with Neighborhood Gardens Trust (NGT) to allow the development of an urban garden at 522 Mercy Street (Greenwich).

4. Redevelopment agreement with Neighborhood Gardens Trust (NGT) to allow the completion of an existing ‘green resource center’ at 3212-24 Ridge Avenue, 3226-34 Ridge Avenue, 3201 and 3203 W. Susquehanna Avenue, and 2201 N. Natrona Street (North Philadelphia).

This concludes the Executive Director’s report.


Review and comment on the proposal to designate a historic district at 1416-32 W Girard Avenue and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places.

Pursuant to the City’s Historic Preservation Ordinance, the Planning Commission must review and comment on the creation of historic districts as to whether the designation of the district is in keeping with larger City policies and plans (Philadelphia2035 Citywide Vision & District Plans).

The Historical Commission will determine whether the district qualifies for inclusion on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places.

Party at Interest: nine properties, six property owners

The purpose is to designate 1416-32 W Girard Avenue as a historic district and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places.

The proposed district is bounded by West Girard Avenue to the North, N. Carlisle Street to the East, N. 15th Street to the West, and the lot lines of the adjacent properties to the South. The district is rectangular in shape, with approximately 195 feet of frontage along W. Girard Avenue, and 114 feet along N. Carlisle and N. 15th Streets. Existing Zoning: CMX-4, with present use: Multi-family, Mixed-use

Additional Information:

- Developed in 1882 by William Weightman.
- The design is attributed to Willis G. Hale.
- The remarkably intact block reflects the popularity of the Victorian Eclectic style.
- The block represents some of the grandest remaining examples of speculative housing in Gilded Age North Philadelphia.
The row is also listed on the National Register as part of the Girard Avenue National Register Historic District.

Questions were asked on if there were any future plans for the building and if the existing signage would be allowed to remain.

**EXISTING CONDITIONS**

The proposed 1416-32 W Girard Avenue Historic District consists of nine properties between N Carlisle and N 15th Streets with frontage along the south side of W Girard Avenue.

4. **Action Item: Acceptance of Chinatown Neighborhood Plan (Presented by John Chin, Philadelphia Chinatown Development Corporation).**

A plan prepared by an organization other than the Commission or a public or quasi-public agency may be submitted to the Commission for acceptance. The Commission shall accept the plan if it determines that the plan is consistent with the general goals and objectives of the adopted Comprehensive Plan. An accepted plan may be considered in the development of the Comprehensive Plan and other Commission policy.

Location: The area bounded by Spring Garden Street, 8th Street, Filbert Street, and 13th Street.

Neighborhood: Chinatown, Callowhill, and Chinatown North

Party at Interest: Philadelphia Chinatown Development Corporation

Purpose: Acceptance of the 2017 Chinatown Neighborhood Plan, prepared by Interface Studio. The plan was funded by a Wells Fargo Regional Foundation grant.

**Built Environment**

I. Housing

- Preserve and upgrade existing affordable housing.
- Develop new affordable housing opportunities.

II. Connectivity

- Bridge the community across Vine Street and the Expressway.
- Make it safer and easier to walk and bike.
- Improve connections to transit.
- Create an inviting and beautiful public realm.
- Manage parking in the commercial core to support businesses and activity.
III. Open Space

- Create more public space and programming for community use.
- Improve access to existing and new spaces.

IV. Economic Opportunity

- 04 - Small Business and Manufacturing.
- Strengthen Chinatown’s commercial core.
- Expand commercial district north of Vine Street.
- Support job-providing small businesses and manufacturing.

Community Life

V. Community Wellness

- Promote community wellness and health.
- Strengthen institutions that provide critical services and serve as a hub of community.

VI. Coalition Building

- Build civic engagement and community stewardship.
- 6.2 Grow and amplify community voice.

Recommendation is for acceptance.

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Eiding, seconded by Commissioner Capita, the Philadelphia City Planning Commission approved recommendation for acceptance of Chinatown Neighborhood Plan.

Commissioner Chen abstained.

5. Action Item: Bill 180099: “An Ordinance to amend the Philadelphia Zoning Maps by changing the zoning designations of certain areas of land located within an area bounded by Master Street, 28th Street, Thompson Street, and 27th Street.” Introduced by Councilmember Greenlee for Council President Clarke on February 15, 2018. (Presented by David Fecteau).

Would like to Rezone to prevent property owners from building multi-family structures.

Existing Zoning: RM-1 Residential Multi-family
Proposed Zoning: RSA-5 Residential Single-Family

Present Use: Derelict industrial buildings, vacant land, single family and multi-family rowhomes.

Proposed Use: Information not available
Additionally, in November 2014, the Commission recommended approval of Bills #140798 and #140799. These bills changed the zoning in Brewerytown from primarily RM-1 to RSA-5 except for Cecil B. Moore Avenue, blocks surrounding Athletic Recreation Center, the 1300 block of Marston Street and blocks between Thompson Street, Girard Avenue, 25th and 28th Streets.

Staff proposed multi-family zoning to attract development, which would otherwise be less likely because of the costs of demolition and possible environmental remediation. Staff also believed that multi-family development south of Master Street would support commercial development on Girard Avenue.

In April 2016, the Commission recommended against approval of Bill #160246, which changed the zoning of blocks between Thompson Street, Girard Avenue, 25th and 28th Streets from RM-1 to RSA-5.

Staff recommendation not for approval.

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Syrnick, seconded by Commissioner Gaston, the Philadelphia City Planning Commission accepted staff recommendation for not to approve.


   a) Bill No: 180101: “An Ordinance to amend the Philadelphia Zoning Maps by changing the zoning designations of certain areas of land located within an area bounded by Silverwood Street, Gay Street, Baker Street, and Carson Street; and to adopt a Master Plan for the former St. Mary of the Assumption Catholic Church and adjacent parcels; all under certain terms and conditions.”


Bill No. 180101 proposes to rezone the site of the St. Mary’s Church from “RSA-5” Residential to “RMX-2” Residential Mixed-Use and proposes “RMX-2” Master Plan for this site. The proposed project consists of 130,832 sq. ft. within both, new and existing structures. Three existing buildings are proposed for adaptive reuse, two of which are historically certified by the City. The proposal includes 56 dwelling units, 35 within the existing church, rectory and school, 21 within new construction, as well as 95 automobile parking spaces, and approximately 30 bicycle parking spaces.

Bill No. 180135 proposes to create a new overlay in the area bounded by Silverwood Street, Gay Street, Baker Street, and Carson Street, called the /STM St. Mary’s Master Plan overlay district. The provisions of this District will only apply to properties where there is an approved Master Plan. The only provision of this new District is that drive aisles for parking may be less than the required 24 feet in width, but not less than 20 feet. The St. Mary’s Master Plan proposes drive aisles that are 23 feet wide, one foot short of the standard requirement.

Site Area: Approximately 69,679 sq.ft.
~Gross Floor Area:

Permitted: 174,198 sq.ft. (250%)
Proposed: 99,639 sq.ft. (143%)

~Open Area:

Required: 17,420 sq.ft. (25%)
Proposed: 34,933 sq.ft. (50%)

Parking

Required Spaces: 17
Proposed Spaces: 95
Bicycle Spaces: 30


Present Use: The vacant St. Mary of the Assumption Church, accessory buildings, and accessory parking lots.

Additional Information:

The Manayunk Neighborhood Council requested a study for the re-use of this site on September 1, 2015. The PCPC completed the “Adaptive Reuse and Redevelopment Analysis” in January of 2016. This analysis recommended to rezone this site to “RMX-2” Residential Mixed-Use. The analysis put forth two scenarios for the Master Plan: Scenario One - 91 units, 130 parking spaces, two-level parking structure built into hillside. Scenario Two - 82 units, 120 parking spaces, one-level parking structure built into hillside, both scenarios call for an adaptive reuse of the church, rectory, and school. This proposal comes in under both of those Scenarios at 56 units and 95 parking spaces.

It should be noted that this plan also requires the installation of a lay-by lane on Carson Street which will be the subject of an upcoming Streets Bill. Staff supports approval of this bill condition on Complete Street Guideline compliance.

Other than the unit count and the lay-by lane proposed for Carson Street, the largest change to the current plan from the one previously approved in May 2017 is that there is now a parking lot proposed on Carson Street, which is now excluded from the Master Plan area. The developer will be transferring this property to a local community organization who will seek variances for the parking lot, at a later date.

The original plan completed its Civic Design Review Committee review on May 2, 2017 after holding two public meetings. The current plan completed Civic Design Review Committee review on March 6, 2018.

Party at Interest: American Living Concepts of Manayunk, LLC.

Staff Recommendation for Bill No. 180101 is approval of the Master Plan and the Bill.
Upon the motion made by Commissioner Gaston, seconded by Commissioner Eiding, the Philadelphia City Planning Commission accepted staff approval for the Master Plan and Bill No. 180101.

Staff recommendation for Bill No. 180135 – Given that this new overlay has only one provision, which could be resolved with a site design change, or a variance request to the Zoning Board of Adjustments, staff recommend this Bill not for approval.

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Eiding, seconded by both, Commissioner Gaston and Commissioner Syrnick, the Philadelphia City Planning Commission granted.

Opposed by Commissioner Vazquez.

7. **Action Item:** Bill No. 180137: “An Ordinance to amend the Philadelphia Zoning Maps by changing the zoning designations of certain areas of land located within an area bounded by Adams Avenue, Tabor Avenue, Harrison Street, Whitaker Avenue, Roosevelt Boulevard, Bingham Street, East Olney Avenue, North Front Street, Nedro Avenue, Hammond Avenue, and Crescentville Road.”Introduced by Councilmember Parker on February 22, 2018 (Presented by Larissa Klevan).

An Area bounded by Adams Avenue, Tabor Avenue, Harrison Street, Whitaker Avenue, Roosevelt Boulevard, Bingham Street, East Olney Avenue, North Front Street, Nedro Avenue, Hammond Avenue, and Crescentville Road. Neighborhood: Lawncrest & Olney

This Bill proposes to amend the zoning designation of certain areas of land located in the Lawncrest and Olney neighborhoods to both match the zoning with the existing land use, particularly for residential properties, and to facilitate commercial growth that is appropriate both in scale and location.

Existing Zoning: Various

Proposed Zoning: Various

The majority of the proposed zoning changes were recommended in the *Philadelphia2035 Lower Northeast District Plan* that was adopted by the City Planning Commission in October of 2012. Additional zoning recommendations were incorporated from the *Upper North District Plan*, which was adopted by the Planning Commission in November of 2016.

Staff recommendation is for approval.

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Gonzalez, seconded by Commissioner Vazquez, the Philadelphia City Planning Commission approved the staff recommendation.


a) Bill No. 180172: “An Ordinance to amend the Philadelphia Zoning Maps by changing the zoning designations of certain areas of land located within an area bounded by Oakmont Street, Torresdale Avenue, Pennypack Creek, Rhawn Street, and Rowland Avenue.”
b) Bill No. 180173: “An Ordinance to amend the Philadelphia Zoning Maps by changing the zoning designations of certain areas of land located within an area bounded by Sheffield Avenue, Leon Street, Solly Avenue, Frankford Avenue, Stanwood Street, and Erdrick Street.”

Bill No. 180172 - An area bounded by Oakmont Street, Torresdale Avenue, Pennypack Creek, Rhawn Street, and Roland Avenue. Neighborhood: Holmesburg

This Bill proposes to amend the zoning designation of certain areas of land in Holmesburg to correctly rezone them to reflect their existing land use.

Existing Zoning: Various

Proposed Zoning: Various

Most of the proposed zoning changes were recommended in the Philadelphia2035 North Delaware District Plan that was adopted by the City Planning Commission in March of 2016. Multiple additional meetings were held with stakeholders in the Holmesburg community to review the proposed changes.

Staff recommendation is for approval.

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Trainer, seconded by Commissioner Eiding, the Philadelphia City Planning Commission approved staff recommendation.

Bill No. 180173 - An area bounded by Sheffield Avenue, Leon Street, Solly Avenue, Frankford Avenue, Stanwood Street, and Erdrick Street. Neighborhood: Holmesburg

This Bill proposes to amend the zoning designation of certain areas of land along Frankford Avenue in Holmesburg to correctly rezone them to reflect their existing land use and promote a more pedestrian oriented commercial corridor.

Existing Zoning: Various

Proposed Zoning: Various

The majority of the proposed zoning changes were recommended in the Philadelphia2035 North Delaware District Plan that was adopted by the City Planning Commission in March of 2016. Multiple additional meetings were held with stakeholders in the Holmesburg community to review the proposed changes.

Staff recommendation is for approval.

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Trainer, seconded by Commissioner Vazquez, the Philadelphia City Planning Commission approved staff recommendation.

Purpose - To create standards around the orientation of Semi-Detached or Twin housing typologies.

Semi-detached homes, also known as twins, are houses that have one wall situated on a shared lot line and adjoin another neighboring property with a side yard. For a twin to be “complete” it must have an abutting second half on a neighboring lot. However, there are many situations where this is not always the case. If there are an odd number of parcels on a block, then there will always be a leftover semi-detached home, this is sometimes referred to as a “twingle”, a single twin home. This legislation seeks to create standards for where to place the adjoining house line and the side yard in all situations that a property owner may find themselves in with the development of a semi-detached structure.

Staff recommendation is for approval.

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Rupe, seconded by Commissioner Bumb, the Philadelphia City Planning Commission had a vote of five, three and one. Vote pending.

Opposed by Commissioner(s) Gaston, Capita and Vazquez.

Commissioner Syrnick abstained.

Commissioner Trainer excused.

10. **Action Item:** Bill No. 180170: “An Ordinance authorizing the revision of lines and grades on a portion of City Plan No. 322 by striking from the City Plan and vacating Glenloch Place from Megargee Street to its terminus northeastwardly therefrom, striking from the City Plan and vacating Ditman Street from a point southwest of Tolbut Street to its terminus further southwestwardly therefrom, and striking from the City Plan and abandoning a certain drainage right-of-way which extends between the said termini of Glenloch Place and Ditman Street, under certain terms and conditions.” Introduced by Councilmember Henon on March 1, 2018. (Presented by Sarah Chiu).

Neighborhood: Holmsburg

Party at Interest:
Stantec Consulting Services, Inc

**Purpose**

a) Striking from the City Plan and vacating Glenloch Place from Megargee Street to its terminus approximately four-hundred sixty feet northeastwardly therefrom.

b) Striking from the City Plan and vacating Ditman Street from a point approximately one-hundred forty-five feet southwest of Tolbut Street to its terminus approximately three-hundred forty-five feet further southwestwardly therefrom.
c) Striking from the City Plan and abandoning a certain forty feet wide drainage right-of-way for construction, reconstruction, repairs, and maintenance of sewers which extends from the said terminus of Glenloch Place, northeast of Megargee Street, to the said terminus of Ditman Street, southwest of Tolbut Street.

This is the former Liddonfield public housing site, currently vacant. NewCourtland Senior Services purchased the site from PHA in 2017 and will use it for senior housing, a health and community center, and sports fields for nearby Holy Family University. The athletic field is on the southern half of the site.

Staff recommendation is for approval.

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Gonzalez, seconded by Commissioner Eiding, the Philadelphia City Planning Commission accepted staff recommendation for approval.

Commissioner Vazquez abstained.

11. **Action Item:** Bill No. 180171: “An Ordinance amending Section 9-208 of The Philadelphia Code, entitled ‘Sidewalk Cafes,’ by permitting sidewalk cafes to be maintained on Frankford Avenue, both sides, from Bleigh Avenue to Wellington Street; and Cottman Avenue, both sides, from Frankford Avenue to Leon Street, all under certain terms and conditions.” Introduced by Councilmember Henon on March 1, 2018. (Presented by Sarah Chiu)

Neighborhood: Mayfair

Party at Interest: Councilman Henon’s office

The purpose is to permit sidewalk cafes on commercial corridor streets in Mayfair, specifically sections of Frankford Ave and sections of Cottman Avenue.

Present Use

Public sidewalks. Frankford Ave’s sidewalk is 20’ wide on both sides; Cottman Ave’s sidewalk is 33.5’ wide on both sides.

Currently the sidewalk café is permitted in center city area, certain commercial area in Manayunk, East Passyunk, and on commercial corridors on Germantown Ave and Ridge Ave in East Falls.

Staff recommendation is for approval.

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Eiding, seconded by Commissioner Capita, the Philadelphia City Planning Commission approved staff recommendation.

12. **Action Item:** Bill No. 180216: “An Ordinance authorizing Timothy McGuriman of St. Joseph’s University to construct, own, and maintain a proposed sidewalk café and planters encroachment at 2461-81 N. 54th Street, Philadelphia, PA 19131, under certain
terms and conditions.” Introduced by Councilmember Jones on March 8, 2018. (Presented by Sarah Chiu)

Neighborhood: Overbrook

Party at Interest: St. Joseph’s University

Purpose

a) Along the curbline of N 54th Street, encroaching eight feet six inches (8'-6") farther into the east N. 54th Street footway.

b) Along the building line of 2461-81 N 54 Street property, encroaching approximately four feet (4'-0") west into the east N. 54th Street footway.

A minimum eight feet six inches (8'-6") of clear passable sidewalk space to remain.

Present Use: Public sidewalk, 25' wide

Additionally, North 54th Street is classified as “urban arterial” by the Complete Street standard, which recommends having half of its sidewalk width free and clear for its walking zone space.

Staff recommendation is not for approval.

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Syrnick, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez, the Philadelphia City Planning Commission accepted staff recommendation of not for approval.

The Philadelphia City Planning Commission meeting was adjourned by the Commission Chair at 2:55 p.m.

The next City Planning Commission Meeting is scheduled for April 17, 2018 at 1:00 p.m.