

ADDRESS: 2213 GREEN ST
Proposal: Replace illegally-removed brownstone pilasters with cast stone
Review Requested: Final Approval
Owner: H+W Apartments LP
Applicant: Lawrence Wind, H+W Apartments LP
History: 1886
Individual Designation: 2/28/1967
District Designation: Spring Garden Historic District, Significant, 10/11/2000
Staff Contact: Meredith Keller, meredith.keller@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

BACKGROUND:
Constructed in 1886, the semi-detached Renaissance Revival-style residence is significant in the Spring Garden Historic District. The building’s front façade features brownstone cladding and ornately carved brownstone detailing. Between May and September 2018, the applicant removed four brownstone pilasters that divide five windows at the fourth story of the front façade. The work was done without a permit. The applicant noted that the pilasters were flaking and delaminating, though the staff contends that they were in repairable condition. The applicant now proposes to replace the illegally-removed brownstone pilasters with cast stone versions.

SCOPE OF WORK:
- Replace four illegally-removed brownstone pilasters with cast stone.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:
The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines include:
- Standard 2: The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of materials or alterations of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
The removal of the brownstone pilasters does not comply with this standard.

- Standard 6: Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
Each replacement pilaster would be cast in three pieces and would introduce two ½-inch mortar joints. The replacement pilasters would not match the old in design or material and would alter the historic appearance of the fourth-story windows. Therefore, the proposed work does not comply with this standard.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Denial, pursuant to Standards 2 and 6.
MAPS & IMAGES:

Figure 1: 2018 Parcel Map. Note that the property is identified as 2215 Green Street, though the OPA-compliant address is 2213 Green Street.

Figure 2: 2213 Green Street, 2018. Source: Cyclomedia.
Figure 3: Condition of the fourth-story pilasters in May 2018. Source: Cyclomedia.

Figure 4: The windows following removal of the brownstone pilasters, September 2018. Source: Google StreetView.
APPLICATION FOR BUILDING PERMIT

APPLICATION # 967573

(Please complete all information below and print clearly)

ADDRESS OF PROPOSED CONSTRUCTION:
2215 GREEN STREET

APPLICANT:
H & W APARTMENTS, LP
MARVIN W. LAWRENCE

COMPANY NAME:
H & W APARTMENTS, LP

PHONE # 267-391-8210 FAX #

PROPERTY OWNER'S NAME:
H & W APARTMENTS, LP

PHONE # 267-391-8210 FAX #

ARCHITECT/ENGINEER IN RESPONSIBLE CHARGE

ARCHITECT/ENGINEERING FIRM:
STRUCTURAL DESIGN ASSOC., SDA

PHONE # 610-458-4470 FAX # 610-458-4471

CONTRACTOR:
SETAG CONSTRUCTION

CONTRACTING COMPANY:

PHONE # 610-584-9241 FAX # 610-584-8377

USE OF BUILDING/SPACE
APARTMENTS-EXISTING

BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF WORK:

REPAIR/BUILDING FRONT PILASTERS PER ATTACHED PLAN & SPECS
INSTALL NEW PILASTERS PER ATTACHED PLAN & SPECS

TOTAL AREA UNDERGOING CONSTRUCTION: 16 square feet

COMPLETE THESE ITEMS IF APPLICABLE TO THIS APPLICATION:

# OF NEW SPRINKLER HEADS (suppression system permits only): LOCATION OF SPRINKLERS:

# OF NEW Registers/DIFFUSERS (hvac/ductwork permits only): LOCATION OF STANDPIPES:

IS THIS APPLICATION IN RESPONSE TO A VIOLATION? ☒ YES ☐ NO VIOLATION #: 4

APPLICANT'S SIGNATURE: LAWRENCE W. LAWRENCE

DATE: 4/19/19

All provisions of the building code and other City ordinances will be complied with, whether specified herein or not. Plans approved by the Department form a part of this application. I hereby certify that the statements contained herein are true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief. I further certify that I am authorized by the owner to make the foregoing application, and that, before I accept my permit for which this application is made, the owner shall be made aware of all conditions of the permit. I understand that if I knowingly make any false statement herein I can be subject to such penalties as may be prescribed by law or ordinance.

(81-3 Rev 5/04)
May 6, 2019

Mr. Randal Baron
Philadelphia Historical Commission
One Parkway
13th Floor
1515 Arch Street
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re 2215 Green Street-Façade Repair-Request for final approval

Mr. Baron:

As we discussed last week, enclosed find our Building Permit Application for final approval to repair the front façade at the location of the 4th floor arched windows. Enclosed are 8 copies of the plan which has been prepared by SDA, our consulting structural engineer, to make and install new cast brownstone pilasters and install them in the area to support the arches. SDA has worked on this complex before and designed cast brownstone steps on our adjacent building 2213 Green. Both buildings are interconnected via mechanical systems. We are working with Don Gates at Setag Construction to prepare a sample of the cast material to match the existing façade in the same manner his firm did the cast front steps. The sample is not included in this submission and will delivered at a later date prior to the hearing.

During this past winter, there was significant flaking and delamination of surface layers of the brownstone at the existing pilasters which came off. SDA provided a quick, safe and temporary fix which would preserve and stabilize the arches during the winter until they could design a permanent solution.

The photos on the SDA plan show the work which was directed by the structural engineers to support the arches and seal the building from water infiltration. The permanent repair which replaces the deteriorated brownstone between the windows with matching cast brownstone and structural remediation solution is detailed on the plan. A photo of the façade pre-dating the repair is included.

We request the Commission review this application at its regular meeting on May 13, 2019 and issue final approval on the building permit so that we can proceed with the permanent repairs.

Thank you,

Lawrence S. Wind, Esq.
For H & W Apartments
PRIOR TO REMOVAL OF BROWNSTONE PILASTERS