**ADDRESS: 219-29 S 18TH ST, UNIT 201**
Proposal: Cut new window openings and inset balcony
Review Requested: Final Approval
Owner: Karen Buchholz
Applicant: John Toates, John Toates Architecture and Design, LLC
History: 1925; Penn Athletic Club, Parc Rittenhouse; Zantzinger, Borie & Medary, architects; alts, Cronheim & Weger, architects, 1957
Individual Designation: None
District Designation: Rittenhouse-Fitler Historic District, Contributing, 2/8/1995
Staff Contact: Jon Farnham, jon.farnham@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

**BACKGROUND:** This application proposes to cut three new window openings and reopen one blind opening at the second floor of the Parc Rittenhouse building at 18th and Locust Streets. The second floor, which was most recently used as office space, is being converted to residential space. All floors above the second floor are already used as residential space.

The building was constructed as the Penn Athletic Club in 1925. The building underwent major renovations in 1957, which were unsympathetic, when it was converted for office space for the U.S. government. At that time, window openings were significantly altered, new window openings and windows were added, and ornamental features were removed. The new window openings were cut based on internal needs, resulting in an irregular window pattern on the exterior. The building was converted to residential use at floors three and above in 2006. The Historical Commission approved many changes for the project, in concept in 2004 and final approval in 2006. A large addition was constructed at the roof and lost ornament was recreated. At that time, the irregular window patterns were regularized and completed at floors three and above. The regularized window pattern was not extended to the second floor in 2006 because it remained office space. The Historical Commission noted that alterations and additions proposed in 2006, including the regularizing of the window openings, would not have been appropriate on many historic buildings, but were appropriate for this building because they overcame the adverse effects of the 1957 renovation.

The second floor is now being rehabilitated as residential space, completing the conversion of the building. The owner of the unit at the corner of 18th and Locust Streets would like to continue the window pattern approved in 2004 and 2006 for floors three and above at the second floor. Two windows would be added on 18th Street and one on Locust Street. The windows would match the historic windows on the second floor, with the exception that they would have brick sills and jambs, not the terra cotta sills, spandrels, and jambs of the historic openings. The new owner would also like to reopen a blind opening on Locust Street for a terrace. Information in the form of a historic photograph as well as photographs of scars on the building demonstrate that the blind opening was a true opening at one time. A replica of metal railings found at the building would be installed in the new opening for the terrace. The Historical Commission reviewed and denied two applications to remove the brick in the blind opening previously, but neither application demonstrated that the opening had been a true opening in the past. Moreover, the denied applications proposed a glass railing and provided no details for the work. The current application offers a justification for reopening the blind opening as well as full details for the alteration.

**SCOPE OF WORK**
- Cut three new window openings and add windows to match existing windows.
- Remove brick infill in opening and install metal railing to create terrace.
STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:
The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines include:

- **Standard 9:** New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new works shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
  
  - The new window openings and windows will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The cutting and installation of the new windows will complete the incomplete window pattern started in 1957 and continued in 2006.
  
  - The re-opening of the blind opening will recreate a historic if not original condition.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends approval, pursuant to Standard 9 and the Historical Commission’s approvals in 2004 and 2006.
# APPLICATION FOR BUILDING PERMIT

## ADDRESS OF PROPOSED CONSTRUCTION:
Unit 201, Parc Rittenhouse 219-229 S. 18th Street

## APPLICANT:
John Toates

## COMPANY NAME:
John Toates Architecture and Design LLC

## PHONE:
484 725 7978

## FAX:

## PROPERTY OWNER'S NAME:
Karen Buchholz

## PHONE:
215 286 8520

## FAX:

## ARCHITECT/ENGINEER IN RESPONSIBLE CHARGE:
John Toates

## ARCHITECT/ENGINEERING FIRM:
John Toates Architecture and Design LLC

## PHONE:
484 725 7978

## FAX:

## CONTRACTOR:
TBD

## CONTRACTING COMPANY:

## LICENSE:
RA-01525-X

## E-MAIL:
John@toatesarchitecture.com

## PROPERTY OWNER'S ADDRESS:
6262 Henry Lane Flourtown, PA 19031

## ARCHITECT/ENGINEERING FIRM ADDRESS:
PO Box 325
Devon, PA 19333

## LICENSE:
RA-01525-X

## E-MAIL:
John@Toatesarchitecture.com

## ESTIMATED COST OF WORK:
$ TBD

## USE OF BUILDING/SPACE:
Residential Condominium Unit

## BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF WORK:
Create 3 new window openings in exterior of building and a small inset balcony space accessible from unit.

## TOTAL AREA UNDERGOING CONSTRUCTION:
100 square feet

## COMPLETE THESE ITEMS IF APPLICABLE TO THIS APPLICATION:

### # OF NEW SPRINKLER HEADS (suppression system permits only):

### LOCATION OF SPRINKLERS:

### # OF NEW Registers/Diffusers hvac/ductwork permits only):

### LOCATION OF STANDPIPES:

## IS THIS APPLICATION IN RESPONSE TO A VIOLATION?
- [ ] NO
- [ ] YES

## VIOLATION #:

All provisions of the building code and other City ordinances will be complied with, whether specified herein or not. Plans approved by the Department form a part of this application. I hereby certify that the statements contained herein are true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief. I further certify that I am authorized by the owner to make the foregoing application, and that, before I accept any permit or which this application is made, the owner shall be made aware of all conditions of the permit. I understand that if I knowingly make any false statement herein I am subject to such penalties as may be prescribed by law or ordinance.

## APPLICANT'S SIGNATURE:

## DATE:
05 / 13 / 2016

(81-3 Rev 5/04)
May 13, 2019

Philadelphia Historical Commission
1515 Arch Street
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA  19102

Re:   Historical Commission Application for Final Approval of Façade Changes to Unit 201 of the Parc-Rittenhouse Building located at 219-229 S. 18th Street.

This application proposes to make several changes to the exterior façade of the second floor of the building along the Southwest corner of 18th Street and Locust. The public facades along 18th and Locust streets will undergo the following changes:

- Two new window openings would be added on the second floor of the 18th St. façade. The windows would flank the southernmost existing window in the existing blank sections of brickwork;
- One new window opening would be added on the second floor of the Locust St. façade. The window would occupy a portion of the blank section of brickwork to the West of the Westernmost existing window.
- Create a recessed balcony space by re-opening the existing fire stair access landing on the second floor to the exterior by creating a new opening in the Locust St. façade, in line with the continuous multi-floor opening directly above this location.

Background information:

Property Location:  219-229 S. 18th Street

Building Owner:   Rittenhouse Regency Affiliates

Unit 201 Owner:  Karen Buchholz

Applicant:   John Toates, RA,    John Toates Architecture and Design LLC

History:  Built 1925, Zantzinger, Borie & Medary, architects, as Penn Athletic Club; Major alterations 1957, Cronheim & Weger, architects; Contributing in Rittenhouse/Fitler District 2/8/1995, Major alterations 2006, Rittenhouse Regency Affiliates
Unit 201 Existing Conditions:

Unit 201 of the Parc-Rittenhouse building occupies the Southwest corner of the second floor of the building with exposures along both S. 18th street facing the park and Locust Street facing the Curtis Institute. At the corner of the building there are two existing 15/15 double hung windows, one facing West and the second facing South. On the Locust street side of the unit, a fire stair landing space that was previously partially open to the exterior exists between the existing fire stair core and the exterior façade. There is evidence from earlier drawings, photographs and existing evidence in the construction of the building that there was previously a door into the fire stair from this balcony location, as well as an opening to the exterior from the landing area in the recessed false window niche in the façade.

Building Background:

The building has undergone several major alterations during its lifetime, and resembles very little of the original design detail or appearance. Originally constructed in 1925 as the Penn Athletic Club, it then was converted to office space and then to mixed use and residential uses. The first major alteration occurred in c. 1957 when the building was converted into office space and significant changes to floors and windows (location, quantity and appearance) were made. Much of the building’s original ornamentation was removed or modified in such a way as to create a completely different appearance than the original design. The second major alteration of the building began in 2006. This alteration included the addition of several floors on top of the existing building, many new windows of different shapes and configurations in the original facades of the building that significantly pushed the overall appearance of the building further from the original design. As part of these permitted changes some of the original ornamentation was added back in return for the Historical Commission approval of the additions and other changes to the building to occur. As a whole, this building has endured several generations of modifications that has allowed it to adapt to the changing economic marketplace and is a successful example of adaptive reuse, even if it no longer resembles the original design. The building now functions as an anchor on Rittenhouse Square with a sense of vibrancy, vitality and the essence of the multi-faceted urban lifestyle.

Proposed Alterations:

The prior modifications to the building’s façade and overall appearance (most recently in 2006) dramatically increased the number, style and location of windows over the entire building. Our proposed modification is limited to a small portion of the second floor façade of the Southwest corner of the building. We are proposing to add two new window openings on the 18th St. façade, one window opening on the Locust St. façade and to re-open the internal fire stair landing to the exterior to create a small inset balcony accessible from unit 201. When you observe the overall progression of the changes to the quantity and location of windows in the building, the omission of
windows on the corners of the second floor appears to be a random oversight. In our proposal, we are looking to further the design goals established by the prior adaptive changes to the façade by placing windows in the most visible blank brick expanses that remain, where elsewhere on the building windows have already been added. The proposed windows differentiate themselves from the prior interventions by combining the scale of the adjacent existing 15/15 windows and the deep set placement of the adjacent windows with the un-adorned brick jamb return and sill details that exist on the upper floor windows that were added in the earlier modifications. The new windows would be aligned with the upper floor windows, and the horizontal datums of the adjacent windows on the second floor. Current façade work along Locust Street has provided the evidence that the brick veneer should be relatively easy to remove and salvage for re-use in creating the new window openings – creating a virtually imperceptible change to the brickwork around the new openings. The new windows would be custom made to match the recently replaced windows along with the exterior trim and molding profiles.

We propose to open the fire stair landing space to match the width of the multi-story ‘slot’ in the façade above it. The recessed space would function as a balcony area for Unit 201. The brick salvaged from the creation of the opening along with the new window openings, would be used to create finished brick jambs on each side of the opening to match the upper floors, along with the interior wall surfaces in the recessed portion of the fire stair landing. The existing terra-cotta belt course would be retained and form the bottom edge of the opening. A new custom iron railing that matches the existing railing design of the building would be added across the opening. The proposed appearance of the space visible from the street would match the appearance of the similar spaces as they already exist on the upper floors directly above it. A door would be added to the East end of the space to mirror the existing internal door that exists already on the West end of the landing. This door configuration matches the arrangement on the upper floors.

Conclusion:

We believe that it can be reasonably concluded that the addition of these 3 windows and the creation of a recessed balcony space will not be contrary to the Secretary of the Interior Standards and the overall goals of the Philadelphia Historical Commission. The commission has previously approved a broad variety of much more significant changes to the appearance of the building, and combined with the unsympathetic modifications in 1957 it only makes sense to approve these changes that might otherwise not be acceptable on other historic buildings.

Sincerely,

John Toates, RA
ORIGINAL DESIGN SKETCH

C. 1925 AS PENN ATHLETIC CLUB
ARCHITECTS: ZANTZINGER, BORIE & MEDARY

PHILADELPHIA HISTORIC COMMISSION
PRESENTATION
UNIT 201 - PARC RITTENHOUSE
219-229 S. 18TH ST
MAY 13, 2019
STREET LEVEL PLAN

PHILADELPHIA HISTORIC COMMISSION
PRESENTATION

c. 1931 BEFORE DESIGN MODIFICATIONS

UNIT 201 - PARC RITTENHOUSE
219-229 S. 18TH ST
MAY 13, 2019

JOHN TOATES
ARCHITECTURE AND DESIGN.
KEY:

- Blue: 1957 ALTERATIONS
- Orange: 2006 ALTERATIONS

FACADE ALTERATIONS DIAGRAM

c. 2006 ALTERATIONS AND ADDITIONS*

*REFER TO APPROVED 2006 HISTORIC COMMISSION APPLICATION - HC MEETING #524 FOR DETAIL

PHILADELPHIA HISTORIC COMMISSION PRESENTATION
UNIT 201 - PARC RITTENHOUSE
219-229 S. 18TH ST
MAY 13, 2019
EXISTING CONDITION PHOTOGRAPH
SIMPLE BRICK WINDOW SURROUND
OBLIQUE
EXISTING CONDITION PHOTOGRAPH
TERRA-COTTA WINDOW SURROUND
(OBLIQUE VIEW)
PHILADELPHIA HISTORIC COMMISSION
PRESENTATION
UNIT 201 - PARC RITTENHOUSE
219-229 S. 18TH ST
MAY 13, 2019

EXISTING CONDITION PHOTOGRAPH
C. 2006 APPROVED BALCONY
RAILING DESIGN INTENT BY HILLIER
ARCHITECTURE

RAILING ELEVATION
SCALE: 1 1/2" = 1'-0"

SEE A3.14 FOR
PROFILE OF CAST
ORNAMENTAL MULLION

PAINTED METAL GUARD ASSEMBLY
TO RESEMBLE EXISTING EXTERIOR
STAIR BALCONY RAILINGS

SEE A3.14 FOR
PROFILE OF CAST
ORNAMENTAL CASING
EXISTING CONDITION PHOTOGRAPH
C. 2006 APPROVED BALCONY RAILING DESIGN

PHILADELPHIA HISTORIC COMMISSION
PRESENTATION
UNIT 201 - PARC RITTENHOUSE
219-229 S. 18TH ST
MAY 13, 2019
EXISTING CONDITION PHOTOGRAPH
CURRENT MODIFICATIONS TO BRICK VENEER

PHILADELPHIA HISTORIC COMMISSION PRESENTATION
UNIT 201 - PARC RITTENHOUSE
219-229 S. 18TH ST
MAY 13, 2019
KEY:
- 1957 ALTERATIONS
- 2006 ALTERATIONS

PHILADELPHIA HISTORIC COMMISSION PRESENTATION
UNIT 201 - PARC RITTENHOUSE
219-229 S. 18TH ST
MAY 13, 2019
EXISTING CONDITION PHOTOGRAPH
LOCUST STREET VIEW

PHILADELPHIA HISTORIC COMMISSION
PRESENTATION
UNIT 201 - PARC RITTENHOUSE
219-229 S. 18TH ST
MAY 13, 2019
EXISTING CONDITION PHOTOGRAPH
18TH STREET VIEW
PROPOSED CONDITION PHOTOGRAPH
SOUTHWEST CORNER VIEW

PHILADELPHIA HISTORIC COMMISSION
PRESENTATION
UNIT 201 - PARC RITTENHOUSE
219-229 S. 18TH ST
MAY 13, 2019
PHILADELPHIA HISTORIC COMMISSION
PRESENTATION
UNIT 201 - PARC RITTENHOUSE
219-229 S. 18TH ST
MAY 13, 2019
PHILADELPHIA HISTORIC COMMISSION
PRESENTATION
UNIT 201 - PARC RITTENHOUSE
219-229 S. 18TH ST
MAY 13, 2019
EXISTING CONDITION PHOTOGRAPH
UNIT INTERIOR FACING SOUTH

PHILADELPHIA HISTORIC COMMISSION
PRESENTATION
UNIT 201 - PARC RITTENHOUSE
219-229 S. 18TH ST
MAY 13, 2019
EXISTING CONDITION PHOTOGRAPH
UNIT INTERIOR FACING SOUTHWEST

PHILADELPHIA HISTORIC COMMISSION
PRESENTATION
UNIT 201 - PARC RITTENHOUSE
219-229 S. 18TH ST
MAY 13, 2019
EXISTING CONDITION PHOTOGRAPH
UNIT INTERIOR FACING WEST

PHILADELPHIA HISTORIC COMMISSION
PRESENTATION
UNIT 201 - PARC RITTENHOUSE
219-229 S. 18TH ST
MAY 13, 2019
EXISTING CONDITION PHOTOGRAPH
UNIT INTERIOR - EAST WALL OF FIRE STAIR

PHILADELPHIA HISTORIC COMMISSION
PRESENTATION
UNIT 201 - PARC RITTENHOUSE
219-229 S. 18TH ST
MAY 13, 2019
EXISTING CONDITION PHOTOGRAPH
UNIT INTERIOR - SOUTH WALL OF FIRE STAIR

PHILADELPHIA HISTORIC COMMISSION PRESENTATION
UNIT 201 - PARC RITTENHOUSE
219-229 S. 18TH ST
MAY 13, 2019