NOMINATION OF HISTORIC DISTRICT PHILADELPHIA REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

SUBMIT ALL ATTACHED MATERIALS ON PAPER AND IN ELECTRONIC FORM (CD, EMAIL, FLASH DRIVE) ELECTRONIC FILES MUST BE WORD OR WORD COMPATIBLE

1. NAME OF HISTORIC DISTRICT (CURRENT/HISTORIC)

Chester-Regent Historic District (no historic name)

2. LOCATION

Please attach a map of Philadelphia locating the historic district.

Councilmanic District(s): 3

3. BOUNDARY DESCRIPTION

Please attach a written description and map of the district boundaries.

4. DESCRIPTION

Please attach a written description and photographs of the built and natural environments/ characteristic streetscape of the district.

5. INVENTORY

Please attach an inventory of the district with an entry for every property. All street addresses must coincide with official Office of Property Assessment addresses.

Total number of properties in district: 41

Count buildings with multiple units as one.

Number of properties already on Register/percentage of total: _____/_0

Number of significant properties/percentage of total: ____ / ___ 2%

Number of contributing properties/percentage of total: 40 / 98%

Number of non-contributing properties/percentage of total: 0 / 0

6. SIGNIFICANCE

Please attach a narrative Statement of Significance citing the Criteria for Designation the resource satisfies. Period of Significance (from year to year): from $_1889$ to $_1892$

CRITERIA FOR DESIGNATION:
 The historic district satisfies the following criteria for designation (check all that apply): (a) Has significant character, interest or value as part of the development, heritage or cultural characteristics of the City, Commonwealth or Nation or is associated with the life of a person significant in the next or
 significant in the past; or, (b) Is associated with an event of importance to the history of the City, Commonwealth or Nation;
 or, (c) Reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style; or, (d) Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style or engineering specimen; or, (e) Is the work of a designer, architect, landscape architect or designer, or engineer whose work has significantly influenced the historical, architectural, economic, social, or cultural development of the City, Commonwealth or Nation; or, (f) Contains elements of design, detail, materials or craftsmanship which represent a significant innovation; or, (g) Is part of or related to a square, park or other distinctive area which should be preserved according to an historic, cultural or architectural motif; or, (h) Owing to its unique location or singular physical characteristic, represents an established and familiar visual feature of the neighborhood, community or City; or, (i) Has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in pre-history or history; or (j) Exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social or historical heritage of the community.
7. Major Bibliographical References Please attach a bibliography.
8. NOMINATOR
Organization University City Historical Society Date October 12, 2018
Jennifer Loustau, Vice President; Name with TitleStaff of the Philadelphia Historical Commission_Emailinfo@uchs.net
Street Address P.O Box 31927 Telephone 215-900-9323
City, State, and Postal Code Philadelphia, PA 19104
Nominator \Box is \Box is not the property owner.
PHC USE ONLY
Date of Receipt: 10/12/2018
Correct-Complete Incorrect-Incomplete Date: $2/15/2019$ Dete: $2/15/2019$
Date of Preliminary Eligibility: 2/5/1998 (NR listing)
Date of Notice Issuance: <u>2/15/2019</u> Date(s) Reviewed by the Committee on Historic Designation: <u>4/17/2019, Criteria C, D, E, & J</u>
Date(s) Reviewed by the Historical Commission: 5/10/2019
Date of Final Action: 5/10/2019
X Designated Rejected 12/7/18

2. LOCATION



Figure 1: The red star indicates the location of the subject district in West Philadelphia.

3. BOUNDARY DESCRIPTION

The proposed district boundary begins at the southwest corner of the intersection of S 45th Street and Chester Avenue, thence extending southeast 350 feet along S 45th Street to the midpoint of a nine foot wide alley; thence extending southwest along said alley and the rear property lines of the sixteen rowhouses on the southeast side of Regent Street 284.5 feet; thence extending northwest along the property lines between 4530 and 4532 Regent Street 100 feet and an additional 25 feet to the center of Regent Street; thence turning southwest and running 136 feet along the center of Regent Street; thence turning 225 feet along S 46th Street to the southeast corner of S 46th Street and Chester Avenue; thence extending northeast along the southeast side of Chester Avenue 420 feet to the place of beginning.



Figure 2: The boundary of the proposed district.

4. DESCRIPTION

The subject district is located to the southwest of Clark Park in the suburban West Philadelphia neighborhood of Spruce Hill, an area characterized by large, residential twin, free-standing, and rowhouse development dating primarily from the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. The district is comprised of 41 three-story, red-brick residences, including one detached house, 24 twin residences, and 16 rowhouses on the treelined streets of Chester Avenue (southeast side, 4500-4530) and Regent Street (the northwest side, 4501-4527 and a portion of the southeast side, 4500-4530). As is common of the neighborhood in general, the properties in the subject district feature front porches and are setback from the street, allowing space for plantings and contributing to the verdant appearance of the district. Historic stone retaining walls line the small front yards of the Regent Street properties, providing distinction and continuity along the block.



Figure 3: The southeast side of Chester Avenue. June 2018.



Figure 4: The southeast side of Chester Avenue. February 2019.



Figure 5: View from 45th Street of the rears of the southeast side of Chester Avenue. February 2019.



Figure 6: Looking west at Regent Street from S 45th Street. June 2018.



Figure 7: The northwest side of Regent Street. February 2019.



Figure 8: The rears of the northwest side of Regent Street. February 2019.



Figure 9: The southeast side of Regent Street. February 2019.



Figure 10: View of the rears of the Regent Street rowhouses from S 45th Street. February 2019.

5. INVENTORY

CHESTER AVENUE TWINS (4500 through 4518 Chester Avenue)

Built: 1889-90 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, West Philadelphia Streetcar Suburb Historic District, contributing

Styles A and B:

On the southeast side of Chester Avenue are five pairs of twin residences, in the following pattern: A-A, B-B, A-A, B-B, A-A, with each side mirroring the other. The overall massing of the picturesque three-story brick twins is consistent between styles, but the façade treatments and fenestration patterns vary. Both styles feature full-width porches with spool turned posts and balusters, exposed rafter tails, and lattice pedimented entryways with decorative spindlework over the steps leading to the porch. Two large front windows face onto the porch. The porches turn onto the side elevations, where they end with the primary entrances, which feature large, half-lite paneled doors with transoms. Above the entrance at the second and third floors is pseudo-turret, which flares out to the full width of the house, and whose curved slate roof is topped with a decorative metal finial. The second and third floors of the turret feature tripartite one-over-one windows with shared lintels and sills. Side windows include square and arched-top openings with squared-top multi-pane-over-one windows. At the rear, the buildings feature rear ells with slightly lower flared, hipped roofs with dormer windows and a central, shared chimney. A frame bay appends the second floor of the rear ell and sits atop a one-story extension at the rear. In addition to these elements, Styles A and B are distinguished by the following:

Style A only:

- 2nd Floor: Tripartite one-over-one window at front with brownstone lintel, sill, and mullions
- 3rd floor: Pyramidally-roofed wall dormer with one-over-one windows, brownstone sill supported by corbelled and denilated brick; decorative brick beltcourse
- Roof: Flared hipped roof with exposed rafter tails, patterned grey slate (scalloped and rectangular), ridge rolls, and decorative finials

Style B only:

- 2nd Floor: Pair of multi-pane-over-one windows separated by a paneled mullion, and topped with a brownstone lintel and patterned brick, set within an arched opening with rusticated brownstone vousoirs; decorative brick beltcourses
- 3rd Floor: Front gable with pair of multi-pane-over-one windows, faux-timbering, topped with flared fishscale shingles, supported by delicate brackets; central corbelled chimney

Style A details:





Style B details:







4520-26 CHESTER AVENUE

Built: 1889-90 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Significant NRHP: 2/5/1998, West Philadelphia Streetcar Suburb Historic District, contributing

Style C:

Within the district, there is a single, free-standing mansion. The three-story brick building is six bays wide by four bays deep and sits on a 120-foot-wide by 125-foot-deep corner lot with a large yard enclosed by a decorative iron fence. The mansion features a broad, wrap-around porch, a complex hipped roof with multiple pyramidal-roofed dormers, and a corner turret with flared conical roof and decorative blind dormers. The design incorporates many of the features found in the twins to the east, including a pedimented porch entrance; patterned slate roof; pyramidal-roofed dormers; window openings with rusticated brownstone vousoirs; and corbelled chimneys.

<u>Alterations</u>: the existing windows all appear to be replacements (one-over-one, double-hung with transoms). While the original window configuration is not known, it is likely that the property once had stained or leaded glass transoms and Queen Anne windows similar to those found throughout the district.



REGENT STREET TWINS (4501 thru 4527 Regent St)

Built: 1889-90 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, West Philadelphia Streetcar Suburb Historic District, contributing

Style D:

On the northwest side of Regent Street, there are seven sets of three-story, red brick twin homes, elevated from the street with small front yards enclosed by a continuous stone wall. The twins, which mirror one another, are each three bays wide and feature mansard roofs broken by a central shared shed dormer, and wall dormers at either end, giving the impression of triple houses. The twins share a full-width porch with hipped roof, decorative posts, brackets and railings. The front doors are centered along the shared party wall. The exposed side elevations feature two arched window openings at the 1st and 2nd floors, and two square windows in a shed dormer at the roof. The rears of the properties historically featured 1st-floor brick extensions and 2nd-floor bays. The bays are rectangular, clad in scalloped siding, and share a continuous roof with the mansard of the main block. Other original/character-defining features include:

- **Front Door:** Paneled half-lite wood door, three square panels over glazing. Bottom panels: two wide horizontal panels over two stacked square panels flanked by vertical rectangular panels.
- Windows: 1st and 2nd floor: brick segmental arched lintels, brownstone sills, squared frames, Queen Anne-over-one windows. Side windows: two, paired windows at 1st and 2nd floors, brick segmental arched lintels, brownstone sills.
- **Roof**: Flared mansard roof with metal ridges and decorative finials, overhanging eaves with exposed rafter tails. Central shared shed dormer with two square-top windows (one per twin). Front wall dormer with dentilled cornice, ridge cresting, and finial. Rectangular grey slate roof with five central rows of hexagonal pattern slate. This pattern carries onto the sides of the shed dormers. Side corbelled chimney and double shed dormer. Rear roof extends to cover bay and features a shed dormer and shared chimney (which was historically corbelled).

Style D details:









REGENT STREET ROW (4500 through 4530 Regent St)

Built: 1890-92 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, West Philadelphia Streetcar Suburb Historic District, contributing

On the southeast side of Regent Street is a variegated row of 16 attached houses that emphasizes the mirror-image twins by alternating pairs of dormer-fronted and flat three-story facades. The porches follow the same rhythm, with pedimented and flat architraves.

Style E:

Two bay wide, three-story brick rowhouse; full-width front porch with turned posts and balusters; half-lite panel door with square transom in arched opening; two windows per floor; 2nd and 3rd fl. arched openings with alternating brick and brownstone vousoirs and square-top, multi-pane-over-one windows with detailed brickmold; corbelled cornice; flat roof.

Style F:

Two bay wide, three-story brick rowhouse; shared pedimented porch roof with turned posts and balusters; half-lite panel door with square transom in arched opening; single, wide 1st floor arched window opening with square-top Queen Anne window and detailed brickmold; two arched 2nd floor window openings with alternating brick and brownstone vousoirs and square-top, multi-pane-over-one windows with detailed brickmold; corbelled brick and simple metal cornice below two-part clipped-corner slate mansard roof; double-wide pedimented dormer with decorative wood window surround and with slate gable front. Only one of the original fiddlehead finials that topped the dormer remains on the block (4520 Regent).

Style E details:



Style F details:



Historic Photos:



Figure 11: 1951 view of 4500 Chester Avenue. Source: Philadelphia Department of Records.



Figure 12: 1951 view of 4500 Regent Street. Source: Philadelphia Department of Records.



Figure 13: 1951 photograph of the rears of 4501-4507 Regent Street. Source: Philadelphia Department of Records.

4500 BLOCK CHESTER AVENUE

4500 Chester Avenue (Style A):

Built: 1889-90 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: replacement windows (in original frames); infilled porch; asphalt roof

4502 Chester Avenue (Style A): Built: 1889-90 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: possible replacement windows; metal panning of some window frames

4504 Chester Avenue (Style B): Built: 1889-90 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

4506 Chester Avenue (Style B): Built: 1889-90 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: replacement sash









Alterations: replacement windows; metal panning on some window frames

4510 Chester Avenue (Style A): Built: 1889-90 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing

NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: storm windows/replacement sash; roof deck

4512 Chester Avenue (Style B): Built: 1889-90 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: storm windows; some replacement sash; faux slate roof

4514 Chester Avenue (Style B): Built: 1889-90 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: storm windows; some replacement sash

HIN DE CLEMENT







4518 Chester Avenue (Style A): Built: 1889-90 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: some replacement sash

4520-26 Chester Avenue (Style C): Built: 1889-90 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Significant NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: replacement windows

4500 BLOCK REGENT STREET (odd)

4501 Regent Street (Style D): Built: 1889-90 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: replacement sash 1st and 2nd fl, panned frames; front door; porch railing; modified chimney









Alterations: replacement sash 1st and 2nd fl; asphalt roof

4505 Regent Street (Style D): Built: 1889-90 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: porch removed; replacement windows; front door; asphalt roof; modified chimney

4507 Regent Street (Style D): Built: 1889-90 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: porch removed; replacement windows/storm windows; modified chimney

4509 Regent Street (Style D): Built: 1889-90 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: replacement windows; panned frames; replacement porch railing; asphalt roof









Alterations: replacement sash (original frames); missing porch railing; asphalt roof; modified chimney

4513 Regent Street (Style D):

Built: 1889-90 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: replacement windows1st and 2nd fl; storm windows

4515 Regent Street (Style D): Built: 1889-90 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: storm windows/panned frames; asphalt roof; modified chimney

4517 Regent Street (Style D): Built: 1889-90 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: replacement windows; asphalt roof









Alterations: replacement windows, front door; asphalt roof

4521 Regent Street (Style D):

Built: 1889-90 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: replacement windows; replacement porch railing and posts; asphalt roof

4523 Regent Street (Style D): Built: 1889-90 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: replacement windows, door; asphalt roof

4525 Regent Street (Style D): Built: 1889-90 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: replacement porch railing, 2nd fl windows; storm windows; asphalt roof









Alterations: replacement windows; faux slate roof

4500 BLOCK REGENT STREET (even)

4500 Regent Street (Style E): Built: 1890-92 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: infilled porch (originally wrap-around); replacement windows, door

4502 Regent Street (Style E): Built: 1890-92 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: replacement windows, porch railing; storm door







Alterations: replacement sash at 2nd & 3rd fl

4506 Regent Street (Style F): Built: 1890-92 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: widened $1^{\mbox{st}}$ fl window; replacement porch railing; storm windows



Alterations: replacement sash







Alterations: replacement sash

4512 Regent Street (Style F): Built: 1890-92 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: replacement sash at 2nd & 3rd fl





4514 Regent Street (Style F): Built: 1890-92 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: replacement windows (orig. frames 2nd & 3rd fl), front door, porch railing & posts



Alterations: 2nd fl replacement sash and panned frames

4518 Regent Street (Style E): Built: 1890-92 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: replacement porch railing, window sash; storm door

4520 Regent Street (Style F): Built: 1890-92 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: replacement sash







Alterations: replacement sash 2nd fl; storm windows



4524 Regent Street (Style E): Built: 1890-92 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: replacement sash 1st fl; storm windows



4526 Regent Street (Style E): Built: 1890-92 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: replacement windows; porch posts and railing (brackets remain); storm door; aluminum-capped cornice



Alterations: stuccoed façade; rebuilt porch; concrete retaining wall on top of stone wall; replacement slate roof



4530 Regent Street (Style F): Built: 1890-92 Architect: Willis G. Hale Classification: Contributing NRHP: 2/5/1998, WPSSHD, contributing

Alterations: replacement sash; replacement slate roof



6. SIGNIFICANCE

The Chester-Regent Historic District satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, E, and J, as delineated in Section 14-1004(4) of the Philadelphia Code, the City's historic preservation ordinance. The Chester-Regent Historic District:

(C) Reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style;

(D) Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style or engineering specimen;

(E) Is the work of a designer, architect, landscape architect or designer, or engineer whose work has significantly influenced the historical, architectural, economic, social, or cultural development of the City, Commonwealth or Nation;

(J) Exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social or historical heritage of the community.

Constructed between 1889 and 1892 on the estate of J. Lewis Crew, the subject district exemplifies the economic, social, and historical heritage of West Philadelphia as it transitioned from a pastoral landscape to a vibrant streetcar suburb. The 41 residential properties that comprise the district present a typical urban hierarchy, with a single-family mansion and major twins on Chester Avenue, to smaller south-facing twins on Regent, and a north-facing set of rowhouses on Regent. Designed by preeminent local architect Willis G. Hale, the district further embodies distinguishing characteristics of the Queen Anne style, a popular late-nineteenth century style that lent itself well to the picturesque suburb of West Philadelphia.

Criterion J: Exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social or historical heritage of the community.

Prior to the Act of Consolidation in 1854, the land on which the subject district was later constructed was located at the northeast corner of Kingsessing Township, a rural township that hugged the west bank of the Schuylkill River south of Blockley Township and east of Darby and Upper Darby Townships, from which it was separated by Cobbs Creek. The boundary between Blockley and Kingsessing Townships ran along Chadsford Turnpike (now Baltimore Avenue) and between the Turnpike and Schuylkill River along Mill Creek (roughly 43rd-45th Streets).

Both Blockley and Kingsessing remained sparsely populated through the eighteenth century, with only 131 property owners between them in 1741.¹ While the early settlers in Kingsessing were of Swedish origin, by the mid-eighteenth century, much of the land in the rural Kingsessing Township had transferred to colonists of English descent, and wealthy Colonists began to establish large country estates along the Schuylkill River.² In 1777, the land around the northeastern township border, surrounding the lower portion of Mill Creek and its large mill pond (now Clark Park), in which the subject district lies, was owned by Lewis Jones, a member of a prominent Quaker family with additional holdings throughout Kingsessing, Blockley, Merion, and other neighboring townships.³

¹ Between 1741 and 1842, the number of "taxables," or property owners, in Blockley Township increased from 72 to 512, while Kingsessing grew more modestly, with an increase from 59 to 162. Source: Samuel Hazard, ed., *The Register of Pennsylvania* III (July 1829): 40.

² Emily T. Cooperman, Ph.D., "Historic Context Statement for University City Planning District," Preservation Alliance for Greater Philadelphia, 2012: 5-6

³ J.M. Duffin's Atlas of Blockley Township Landowners, 1777. University Archives, University of Pennsylvania.

culls (For Rou Coulton 3 Jun P Tones Will ultis aw Mill Whilma Lown

Figure 14: Detail of 1752 Scull and Heap A Map of Philadelphia and Parts Adjacent, showing the early landowners in Kingsessing and Blockley. The Jones family name appears numerous times on the map. Source: University Archives, University of Pennsylvania.



Figure 15: The red star indicates the general location of the subject district, the land around which was owned in the eighteenth century by Lewis Jones, whose property straddled Mill Creek and the township line. Source: J.M. Duffin, *Atlas of Blockley Township Landowners in 1777*, Plate 16. University Archives, University of Pennsylvania.



Figure 16: Detail of the 1808 John Hills *Plan of the City of Philadelphia and Environs*, showing the early development of Hamilton Village. John Hamilton's Woodlands estate is located just north of land owned by the Jones family on Mill Creek. The land on which the subject district would later be developed is just to the southwest of the creek. Source: Greater Philadelphia GeoHistory Network.



Figure 17: 1843 Charles E. Ellet atlas showing the approximate location of the subject district. Source: Greater Philadelphia GeoHistory Network.

Although descendants of the Jones family would be involved with the development of the subject district, it would take over a hundred years, an escalation in immigration and industrialization, and several advancements in transportation technology, for development pressure to reach this portion of West Philadelphia, which remained rural well into the nineteenth century. During the eighteenth century, four main wagon-ways were blazed through Blockley and Kingsessing to connect Philadelphia to the agrarian lands to the west-- Lancaster Pike to the northwest, Market Street due west, and Baltimore Pike and Darby Road to the southwest.⁴ Three ferries across the Schuylkill River (the simply-named Upper, Middle, and Lower ferries) also connected West Philadelphia to Philadelphia at present-day Spring Garden Street, Market Street, and Gray's Ferry Avenue (see Figure 16).

In 1805, the first permanent bridge over the Schuylkill River was constructed at Market Street, creating the possibility of daily use by would-be commuters, but the substantial fares charged by private horsedrawn omnibus companies that opened along the route limited ridership. Though the Market Street bridge offered a more direct connection to the city, it was not until the introduction of true street car systems that West Philadelphia really began to grow.

Development of the neighborhoods of Hamilton Village (or Hamiltonville), Greenville, and Mantua followed, the pocketed nature of these communities becoming typical of development in West Philadelphia. Unlike Center City Philadelphia, in which development commenced at the river and pushed inland, development in West Philadelphia did not unfold linearly or uniformly, with the space between pockets of development filling in gradually.⁵

In July 1858, the first horse-drawn trolley service opened on tracks along Market Street between 3rd Street and 41st Street, where it turned north to a depot at Haverford Avenue.⁶ Within a few months of the opening of this West Philadelphia Passenger Railroad, additional lines opened serving other parts of West Philadelphia, including along Lancaster Pike and Darby Road (now Woodland Avenue). By 1870, only 12 years after the opening of the first street car line in West Philadelphia, the area's population had nearly tripled, from 11,487 to 44,337.⁷ The total population of Philadelphia would nearly double in the following three decades, from 675,000 in 1870 to 1.3 million in 1900, owing to a symbiotic rise of immigration and industrialization. Coupled with the relocation of the University of Pennsylvania from 9th and Market Streets to West Philadelphia in 1871, the Centennial Exposition in Fairmount Park in 1876, and the conversion of trolleys from horse-drawn to electric-power, West Philadelphia underwent an explosion of upper and upper-middle class housing construction in its transition from farmland to suburb. While transportation innovations enabled commuting, it was the speculative developers that followed who would ultimately shape the development of West Philadelphia.⁸

With transportation infrastructure in place and increasing, and a growing population and workforce citywide, speculative developers set out to entice would-be residents to "pleasant, stately (though not palatial) homes in pleasant environs" in West Philadelphia's pastoral landscape, away from the overcrowded city center.⁹ These new "streetcar suburbs" were created by a generation of developers ranging from estate owners who divided and sold their family properties, to land speculators, building contractors and tradesmen, and even government officials. Development occurred in clusters rarely larger than a few blocks at a time, since most developers did not have the means and credit to create larger developments. Some developers chose to develop blocks of houses for people of the same social standing, while others aimed to appeal to people of varying social standing. Early developments

⁴ Leon S. Rosenthal, *A History of Philadelphia's University City* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania, 1963), 4-11. ⁵ "West Philadelphia: The History," West Philadelphia Community History Center. Available online: <u>https://westphillyhistory.archives.upenn.edu/history</u>

⁶ Robert Carl Jackle, "Philadelphia Across the Schuylkill: Work, Transportation and Residence in West Philadelphia, 1860-1910" (unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, Temple University, 1985), 43.

⁷ John Daly and Allen Weinberg, *Genealogy of Philadelphia County Subdivisions* (Philadelphia: Dept. of Records, 1966), 94, 98. ⁸ Ibid., 45, 93-94.

⁹ The availability of land also contributed to institutional development in West Philadelphia during the nineteenth century. "Chapter 2: Transportation Innovations," West Philadelphia Community History Center. Available online: https://westphillyhistory.archives.upenn.edu/history/chapter-2#transportation-innovation

established a hierarchy that continued into the late nineteenth century, with large, freestanding villas for the wealthiest buyers placed along the city's main thoroughfares such as Chestnut, Walnut, Spruce, and Locust Streets or with immediate access to streetcar lines, while the numbered and intermediary streets were designed with more modest, but spacious, "double houses" for upper-middle class residents, such as those designed by Samuel Sloan for the elegant "terraces" that stretched south of Baltimore Avenue between 40th and 42nd Street.¹⁰ Speculative rowhouse developments also occurred, but ample setbacks, porches, and yards gave such houses a distinctive suburban character despite their denser configuration.¹¹

The subject district perfectly exemplifies these trends in the development of West Philadelphia in the late nineteenth century. In 1875, J. Lewis Crew, an oil merchant, whose recently-deceased wife Anna née Levick was a descendant of the Jones family who had settled the area in the eighteenth century, purchased a large parcel of land with a single home between Chester and Kingsessing Avenues, 46th Street, and the platted, but not yet constructed, 45th Street.¹² Despite the presence of some fairly small parcels, the surrounding area remained largely rural through the 1870s and into the 1880s. By 1889, with development booming to the northeast, plans for an extension of trolley tracks along Chester Avenue from 42nd and 47th Streets underway, and a recent development of Queen Anne twins at 49th and Chester, Crew sensed the development potential of his property.¹³ He had Regent Street laid out between 45th and 46th Streets, and, through a series of complicated (and therefore typical) real estate transactions involving a conveyancer named Henry S. Parmalee and a builder named H.T. Supplee, was able to take advantage of the hot housing market to create his own streetcar suburb.¹⁴

Crew sold his property, including the original home at the southeast corner of 46th Street and the newlycreated Regent Street, and, retaining a large corner parcel for a grand, new mansion for his family, allowed the rest of the land to be divided into smaller parcels with three other tiers of housing by H.T. Supplee.¹⁵ Crew and Supplee hired prominent local architect Willis G. Hale to design a series of houses that were architecturally cohesive, but distinguished by location, scale, and type. At the prominent corner of 46th Street and Chester Avenue, Crew commissioned a large, free-standing home for his family (4520-26 Chester Avenue), to the east of which Supplee constructed a set of large twins, or "double houses."¹⁶

¹² The Levicks and Joneses were early Quaker families in Philadelphia. Source: John W. Jordan, ed., *Colonial Families of Philadelphia*, vol. II (New York, NY: Lewis Publishing Company, 1911). Lewis Jones' brother James was the father of Isaac Jones, who married Mary Wetherill in 1778. Isaac and Mary had a daughter named Elizabeth Wetherill Jones, who married Ebenezer Levick. Elizabeth and Ebenezer Levick's daughter Anna Levick married Jacob Lewis Crew in 1853. Anna Levick Crew died in 1872 at the age of 41, leaving behind her husband and two daughters. Source: Haverford College; Haverford, Pennsylvania; *Minutes, 1800-1858*; Collection: *Philadelphia Yearly Meeting Minutes*; Call Number: *JK2.14*. Source: Ancestry.com. *U.S., Quaker Meeting Records, 1681-1935* [database on-line]. Provo, UT, USA: Ancestry.com Operations, Inc., 2014; The Crews purchased the property between Chester and Kingsessing Avenues and 45th and 46th Streets in 1875 from Henry and Maria Fussel. "Henry B. Fussel to J. Lewis Crew," Philadelphia Deed Book FTW, no. 245, p. 182, December 4, 1875, Philadelphia Department of Records.
 ¹³ "...A certain fifty feet wide street called Regent Avenue recently laid out and opened by J. Lewis Crew...", from "Henry T. Supplee to William E. Gibson," Philadelphia Deed Book TG no. 43, p. 522, Philadelphia Department of Records. This is corroborated by the Philadelphia Streets Department's City Plans Legal Card, which notes that Regent Street was laid out in 1889. <u>https://s3.amazonaws.com/streets-legal-cards/LegalCards/LC016552.JPG</u>

¹⁶ "Willis G. Hale, architect, Lucas Building, Juniper and Chestnut Streets, has completed plans for a lot of houses for Mr. H.T. Supplee, Forty-sixth street, near Chester avenue. To be double houses in construction; of brick; terra-cotta trimmings, fitted

¹⁰ By the 1920s, many of the nineteenth century homes would be demolished for the construction of larger four or five story apartment buildings. Many of West Philadelphia's mansions would also be demolished and replaced with denser housing, or divided into multiple units. "West Philadelphia Streetcar Suburb," University City Historical Society, accessed February 1, 2019, http://www.uchs.net/HistoricDistricts/wpsshd.html.

¹¹ "Chapter 2: Transportation Innovations," West Philadelphia Community History Center. Available online: <u>https://westphillyhistory.archives.upenn.edu/history/chapter-2#transportation-innovation</u>

¹⁴ William H. Jones, "Plan of the extension of the tracks of the West Phila. Passenger Railway Co. on Chester Avenue from 42nd to 47th Streets in the 27th Ward, Philadelphia [Survey returned June 29, 1889; approved by Board of Surveyors July 1, 1889], 1889," Philadelphia Streets Department Survey and Designs Bureau, Greater Philadelphia GeoHistory Network.

¹⁵ The deed of sale between J. Lewis Crew and Henry T. Supplee specified the minimum size lots of 30' x 80' for lots on Regent Street, although it does not appear this stipulation was followed precisely. "J. Lewis Crew to Henry T. Supplee," Philadelphia Deed Book GGP, no. 535, p. 179, July 20, 1889, Philadelphia Department of Records.

Shortly thereafter, Supplee began a series of smaller twins and rowhouses along Regent Street.^{17,18} As was typical in the development of West Philadelphia, restrictive covenants were placed on the deeds to prevent the use of the properties for "offensive purpose or occupation," including industrial, manufacturing and most commercial uses.¹⁹



Figure 18: 1886 J.L. Smith Atlas of the 24th and 27th Wards, West Philadelphia - Plate 27. Under J.C. Crew. Source: Athenaeum of Philadelphia.

with electricity and gas for lighting purposes, heated by heaters, and all modern conveniences applied for general comfort. Also, plans for one J.L. Crew, Esq, at Forty sixth street and Chester avenue. To be of brick, and stone trimmings, some terra-cotta, pitched roof, with fancy slate, and fitted with electricity and gas; as well as other comforts. The mode of heating as yet unsettled." PRERBG, v. 4, no. 10, 1889, p. 113, 3/13/1889.

¹⁷ In 1890, the Philadelphia Real Estate and Builders' Guide reported that, "H.T. Supplee is contemplating the building of sixteen three-story dwellings southeast [sic, presumably southwest] corner of 45th and Regent Streets. They will be of brick with stone trimmings and fitted with all the modern conveniences." PRERBG, v. 5, 1890, p. 610, 10/8/1890.

¹⁸ In 1891, Supplee sold the southeastern half of the Crew estate, extending from Regent St to Kingsessing Ave, and including the original home, called a mansion in the deed, along with the sixteen unfinished dwellings to manufacturer William Gibson. The portion of the property along Kingsessing Ave and 46th Street would be developed in the following years, after exchanging hands multiple times. Likewise, the original mansion was demolished between 1892 and 1895 to make way for three additional sets of twins. "Henry T. Supplee to William E. Gibson," Philadelphia Deed Book T.G., no. 43, p. 522. Philadelphia Department of Records; and Philadelphia Registry Map Historical Index, 27-S-14.

¹⁹ "J. Lewis Crew to Henry T. Supplee," Philadelphia Deed Book GGP, no. 535, p. 180, July 20, 1889, Philadelphia Department of Records. "West Philadelphia Streetcar Suburb," University City Historical Society.



Figure 19: By 1892, the Chester-Regent district had been fully constructed and awaited sale or rental. The Crew's original home is still present at the southeast corner of 46th and Regent Streets. Source: Walter S. Bromley 1892 *Atlas of the 27th Ward, West Philadelphia* - Plate 8. University Archives, University of Pennsylvania.



Figure 20: By 1895, the rest of the Crew estate had been built out, and development was pushing further west. Source: Greater Philadelphia GeoHistory Network.



Figure 21: By 1910, Clark Park had opened to the east of the subject district, and development west of 42nd Street had increased dramatically, even going beyond 49th Street and the Pennsylvania Railroad tracks. Source: Greater Philadelphia GeoHistory Network.

Criterion C: Reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style; and Criterion D: Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style or specimen.

The subject development followed the hierarchy established throughout West Philadelphia, with the grandest houses fronting on the prominent Chester Avenue. Backing up the Chester Avenue twins were slightly smaller twins on equally wide, but less deep, lots along the smaller Regent Street. A set of sixteen rowhouses was constructed across from those on the southeast side of Regent Street. For this development, architect Willis G. Hale, known best for his elaborate work in the Victorian Eclectic idiom, employed a less flamboyant variant of the Queen Anne style, popular in Philadelphia and throughout the country in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

At the time of this development, J. Lewis Crew owned the block with one house and a barn on the property, and Clarence Clark owned the bulk of the land east of it, from Baltimore Avenue down to Woodland Avenue, and another parcel south of the property on Kingsessing Avenue. While Clark was instrumental in developing much of the land in Spruce Hill, he recognized the need to leave some open space for public usage. The triangular piece of land that had formerly been a mill pond (until Mill Creek was redirected underground, 1866-1895) was donated by Clark to the city of Philadelphia and named Clark Park (1895). This is in keeping with the broader "Picturesque Movement" that characterized the growth and popularity of West Philadelphia. "[West Philadelphia's] streets are broader, it is more filled with sunlight and air, and so picturesque is its general aspect that it has been termed 'the city of villas."²⁰

With its picturesque qualities, the Queen Anne style lent itself well to suburban design. Distinguishing characteristics of the Queen Anne style employed in the subject district include round and square towers; expansive porches with delicate turned porch supports and spindlework; multi-pane over one windows; patterned brickwork and corbelled chimneys; steeply sloped and hipped roofs with lower cross gables and gable dormers, accented by patterned slate, fishscale shingles, faux timbering, and deep eaves with exposed rafter tails.

While the Regent Street twins in particular do not fit perfectly into the Queen Anne mode, their unusual forms and roof shapes are indicative of Willis Hale's idiosyncratic style. Best known for having worked with William Weightman and P.A.B. Widener on a variety of speculative housing in North Philadelphia, Willis Hale also participated in similar, albeit fewer, developments in the emerging suburb of West Philadelphia. As in North Philadelphia, Hale deployed similar stylistic vocabulary and embellishments west of the Schuylkill River.²¹ In the subject development, Hale's usually exuberant Queen Anne eclecticism is more refined, but no less playful, and the style was used to bring the different housing types (rowhouse, twin, single detached) into a unified expression, while nonetheless marking the collection of buildings with a unique aesthetic flair.

Criterion E: The historic district is the work of a designer, architect, landscape architect or designer, or engineer whose work has significantly influenced the historical, architectural, economic, social, or cultural development of the City, Commonwealth or Nation.

Born in 1848 in Seneca Falls, New York, Willis Gaylord Hale was raised and schooled at a number of locations in central New York. Unable to join the Union Army during the Civil War because of his youth, Hale eventually began studying architecture, first in Buffalo and later in Rochester. Upon his arrival in Philadelphia in the mid-to-late 1860s, he worked in the office of Samuel Sloan, a local architect most noted for his standard-setting institutional buildings and grandiose residential buildings. Subsequently, he worked in John McArthur's office while the firm was planning Philadelphia's new City Hall.²² According to Carol Eaton's 1971 University of Pennsylvania thesis on Hale, "any propensity Hale might have had toward an eclectic approach to architecture was certainly not suppressed in the office of Samuel Sloan,"

²⁰ Joseph Minardi, *Historic Architecture in West Philadelphia*, 1738-1930s. 2011.

²¹ Carol Eaton, "Willis G. Hale" (Research paper, University of Pennsylvania, 1971.

²² Sandra L. Tatman and Roger W. Moss. *Biographical Dictionary of Philadelphia Architects:* 1700-1930. Boston: G.K. Hall & Co., 1985, page 325.

whose pattern books such as *City and Suburban Architecture* depicted buildings "wondrously imaginative with [their] Moorish arches, strange pinnacles, and lacy entrances."²³ Hale then worked with John MacArthur as he was completing Philadelphia City Hall which "certainly didn't serve to lessen any eclectic bent" he must have had. But unlike these men, Hale "liked to integrate and duplicate motifs and patterns. His affinity for music perhaps made him play with motifs in this particular way."²⁴

Hale's heavy, complicated design style also drew heavily on the work of Frank Furness. In his own time, Hale was criticized by some for what was deemed to be his inadequate training and undue willingness to cater to the whims and excesses of his gauche *nouveau-riche* clients. He was targeted with an "Architectural Aberrations" column in the Architectural Record for the alleged bad taste of his designs, but his best work was forward-thinking and anticipated the Art Nouveau and Style 1900 movements that subsequently came to the fore in Europe.²⁵

Hale married into the locally-prominent Weightman family and built up an impressive resume of clients, becoming by the 1880s the principal architect for Philadelphia's burgeoning population of *nouveau-riche* industrialists and businessmen. From the 1870s through the 1890s Hale received important commissions



Figure 22: Circa 1895 photograph of the Peter A.B. Widener mansion at the corner of N. Broad Street and Girard Avenue, designed by Willis Hale in 1886.

for wealthy clients along North Broad Street, including William Elkins, William Weightman, and streetcar magnate, real estate developer, and philanthropist Peter A.B. Widener. Widener epitomized the aesthetic ideals and social aspirations of the North Broad Street elites, and the extraordinary mansion that Hale designed for him in 1886 set the standard for social climbers citywide (Figure 22). Other significant Hale projects for the *nouveau riche* include the extravagant, flamboyant house for Morris Fleisher at 2223 Green Street (1880) and the more restrained house for Benjamin Fleisher at 2301 Green Street (1890).

Widener, Elkins, and Weightman developed speculative rows of houses in new neighborhoods serviced by their trolleys in North Philadelphia, and Hale worked on those development projects as well.

Excellent examples include the speculative rows of the 1880s on the 1500-block of N. 17th Street (Figure 23), the 1700 block of Jefferson Street, and the 2300 block of Thompson Street.



Figure 23: Speculative houses on the 1500 block of N 17th Street, designed by Hale in 1886. Source: Cyclomedia, 2018 (left); Philadelphia Historical Commission files (right).

²³ Eaton, op. cit.

²⁴ Ibid.

²⁵ <u>Architectural Record</u>, v.3, p.207-210, Oct.-Dec., 1893.

While Hale is best known for having worked with Weightman and Widener on a variety of speculative housing in North Philadelphia, he also participated in similar, albeit fewer, developments in the emerging suburb of West Philadelphia. As in North Philadelphia, Hale deployed similar stylistic vocabulary and embellishments west of the Schuylkill River.²⁶ In the subject development, Hale's usually exuberant Queen Anne eclecticism is more refined, but no less playful, and the style was used to bring the different housing types (rowhouse, twin, single detached) into a unified expression, while nonetheless marking the collection of buildings with a unique aesthetic flair. The subject houses also all have decorative wooden porches, an architectural component that has come to define the West Philadelphia Victorian-era house.

On March 10th of 1895, *The Times* of Philadelphia wrote a paean to Hale that expressed both the aspirations of the day and Hale's success in fulfilling those aspirations. The article, titled *Brainy Builders of this Big City: Men Prominent in Philadelphia's Rapid Development*, has no byline.

Someone has said that in the future this century will be remembered chiefly as an epoch in which the useful and the beautiful were first perfectly united....The modern tendency of populations to centralize in the cities, thereby increasing the prices of business properties to figures which would have seemed fabulous in the past century, has, by greatly reducing the size of building sites, made new and severe demands upon the genius of the architect. Thus handicapped, many have proven unequal to the exigencies of the time, but I am proud to say that Philadelphia boasts of a large number of those who have overcome the greatest obstacles imposed by modern conditions. As prominent representative of this class I may mention Willis G. Hale, who is not only distinguished by unusual efficiency in any given style, but by a versatility which is little less than marvelous.

Hale's West Philadelphia commissions are largely undocumented so it is no simple task to understand how many were built or are extant. Two remnants of a grand rowhouse development that is attributed to Hale in his 1894 publication *Selections from an Architect's Portfolio* in the 3900 block of Spruce Street. There are three rowhouses in the 4200 block of Walnut Street that have a similar style to the Spruce Street development with ogee gable peaks and Roman brick façades; there are similar stylistic games being played in Hale's development on Broad at Poplar Streets. However, the style of the subject district takes on the architectural appearance of some of the lower-end houses within Hale's portfolio outside of West Philadelphia. For example, the twins and rowhouses in the subject district have rooflines whereby the plane of the primary elevation wall extends past the sloping Mansard roof at the third floor creating a modified dormer window not unlike the primary elevation of the David Garrison Residence at 1164 South Broad Street. While the association between Hale and the developers of the subject district remain somewhat ambiguous, certainly with the high profiles J. Lewis Crew and Henry S. Parmalee had in Philadelphia speculative development, Hale would have been an unsurprising choice to give the subject buildings some architectural character while addressing the different aspects of each house footprint, bringing the whole together in a harmony of stylistic rhythms and forms.²⁷

Conclusion

The Chester-Regent Historic District is an intact, late-nineteenth century residential development project that characterized the booming streetcar suburb of West Philadelphia in the second half of the nineteenth century. Designed by preeminent architect Willis G. Hale, the 41 properties, designed in six different styles, all embody distinguishing characteristics of the Queen Anne style, as interpreted by Willis G. Hale.

²⁶ Eaton, op. cit.

²⁷ "West Philadelphia Streetcar Suburb," University City Historical Society, accessed February 1, 2019, http://www.uchs.net/HistoricDistricts/wpsshd.html.

7. MAJOR BIBLIOGRAPHICAL REFERENCES

"Chapter 2: Transportation Innovations," West Philadelphia Community History Center. Available online: <u>https://westphillyhistory.archives.upenn.edu/history/chapter-2#transportation-innovation</u>

Cooperman, Emily T., Ph.D. "Historic Context Statement for University City Planning District." Preservation Alliance for Greater Philadelphia, 2012.

Daly, John, and Allen Weinberg, *Genealogy of Philadelphia County Subdivisions* (Philadelphia: Dept. of Records, 1966).

Eaton, Carol. "Willis G. Hale" (Research paper, University of Pennsylvania, 1971.

Hazard, Samuel, ed. The Register of Pennsylvania III (July 1829): 40.

Minardi, Joseph. *Historic Architecture in West Philadelphia 1789-1930s,* Atglen, PA, Schiffer Publishing Ltd., 2011.

Jackle, Robert Carl. "Philadelphia Across the Schuylkill: Work, Transportation and Residence in West Philadelphia, 1860-1910" (unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, Temple University, 1985).

Jones, William H. "Plan of the extension of the tracks of the West Phila. Passenger Railway Co. on Chester Avenue from 42nd to 47th Streets in the 27th Ward, Philadelphia [Survey returned June 29, 1889; approved by Board of Surveyors July 1, 1889], 1889."

Jordan, John W., ed. *Colonial Families of Philadelphia*. Vol. II. New York, NY: Lewis Publishing Company, 1911.

Rosenthal, Leon S. A History of Philadelphia's University City (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania, 1963), 4-11.

Tatman, Sandra L., and Roger W. Moss. *Biographical Dictionary of Philadelphia Architects:* <u>1700-1930</u>. Boston: G.K. Hall & Co., 1985.

"West Philadelphia Streetcar Suburb," University City Historical Society, accessed February 1, 2019, http://www.uchs.net/HistoricDistricts/wpsshd.html.