NOMINATION OF HISTORIC BUILDING, STRUCTURE, SITE, OR OBJECT PHILADELPHIA REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION Submit all attached materials on paper and in electronic form (cd, email, flash drive) Electronic files must be Word or Word compatible		
1. ADDRESS OF HISTORIC RESOURCE (must comply with an Office of Property Assessment address) Street address: 4525 Spruce Street		
Postal code: <u>19139</u> Councilmanic District: <u>3</u>		
2. NAME OF HISTORIC RESOURCE Historic Name: <u>Francis J. Hill Residence</u> Current/Common Name: <u>4525 Spruce Street</u>		
3. TYPE OF HISTORIC RESOURCE		
4. PROPERTY INFORMATION Occupancy:		
5. BOUNDARY DESCRIPTION Attached		
6. DESCRIPTION Attached		
 7. SIGNIFICANCE Please attach the Statement of Significance. Period of Significance (from year to year): from <u>1929</u> to <u>1942</u> Date(s) of construction and/or alteration: <u>1905</u> Architect, engineer, and/or designer: <u>Mahlon H. Dickinson</u> Builder, contractor, and/or artisan: <u>Charles McCaul</u> Original owner: <u>Francis J. Hill</u> Other significant persons: <u>Dr. Albert C. Barnes, owner</u> 		

	CRITERIA FOR DESIGNATION:		
	 The historic resource satisfies the following criteria for designation (check all that apply): (a) Has significant character, interest or value as part of the development, heritage or concharacteristics of the City, Commonwealth or Nation or is associated with the life of a persignificant in the past; or, 		
	(b) Is associated with an event of importance to the history of the City, Commonwealth	or Nation;	
	 or, (c) Reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style; (d) Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style or engineering species (e) Is the work of a designer, architect, landscape architect or designer, or engineer who has significantly influenced the historical, architectural, economic, social, or cultural devite the City, Commonwealth or Nation; or, 	imen; or, ose work	
	(f) Contains elements of design, detail, materials or craftsmanship which represent a sig	gnificant	
	innovation; or, (g) Is part of or related to a square, park or other distinctive area which should be prese	rved	
	 according to an historic, cultural or architectural motif; or, (h) Owing to its unique location or singular physical characteristic, represents an establi 	shed and	
	familiar visual feature of the neighborhood, community or City; or,		
	 (i) Has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in pre-history or history; (j) Exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social or historical heritage of the communication 		
8. MAJOR BIBLIOGRAPHICAL REFERENCES			
	Attached		
	9. Nominator		
	OrganizationDateApril 30, 2018		
	Name with Title Miss Corey Loftus Email cloftusm@gmail.com		
	Street Address 4109 Locust Street (rear) Telephone 610-291-7412		
	City, State, and Postal Code Philadelphia, PA 19104		
	Nominator \Box is \Box is not the property owner.		
	PHC USE ONLY		
	Date of Receipt: <u>April 30, 2018 (revised)</u>		
	Correct-Complete Incorrect-Incomplete Date: <u>September 13, 2018</u>		
	Date of Notice Issuance: <u>September 14, 2018</u>		
	Property Owner at Time of Notice Name: <u>James Cook</u>		
	Address: <u>4525 Spruce Street</u>		
	City: <u>Philadelphia</u> State: <u>PA</u> Postal Code: <u>19139</u>		
	Date(s) Reviewed by the Committee on Historic Designation: December 12, 2018		
	Date(s) Reviewed by the Historical Commission: January 11, 2019		
	Date of Final Action: January 11, 2019		
	🛛 Designated 🛛 🗌 Rejected	3/12/18	

Criterion C added by PHC

Section 5: Boundary Description

The boundary description of 4525 Spruce Street is as follows:

Beginning at a point formed by the intersection of the North side of Spruce Street with the West side of Melville Street. Containing in front or breadth on the said side of Spruce Street 45 feet and extending of that width in length or depth Northward the East line thereof being along the West side of Melville Street 135 feet. Being No. 4525 Spruce Street.



Figure 1. Property boundaries of 4525 Spruce Street. Source: Google Maps.

Section 6: Architectural Description

Located on the Northwest corner of Spruce and S. Melville Streets between S. 45th and S. 46th streets, the property at 4525 Spruce Street is a three-story, hip-roofed, detached, corner residence with a front yard. The Renaissance Revival style is representative of a large and important trend away from the picturesque prettiness of the "Queen Anne" style of the 1880s and 1890s, toward a more formal, classical vocabulary. The style does not cite any historical source exclusively and instead favors a generically vernacular and rural kind of Italian style exemplified in details like the broad eaves, gently sloping roof, and round headed windows on the top floor. ¹

Stylistically, the residence is an architecturally ambitious project on a detached corner lot designed distinctively from its neighbors. The dwelling was built in 1905 by Philadelphia contractor Charles McCall (also spelled McCaul) "under owner's supervision."² The property owner, Francis J. Hill, a well-known railroad contractor of the firm Reiter, Curtis and Hill, bought the lot from neighbor Frank S. Elliot on June 6, 1904.³ The architect and engineer of the residence is Mahlon H. Dickinson, 2nd, (fl. 1891-1929).⁴ M.H. Dickinson designed a neighboring Colonial style residence (house no. 4537) on the NE corner of 46th and Spruce Streets the year prior. His general practice included the construction of theaters, warehouses and residences in the city of Philadelphia.

Following Hill's death in November 1923, the residence was advertised in the *Philadelphia Inquirer* in February of 1924 with a description of its "Twelve rooms, electric light, hotwater heat, every possible modern convenience. Solid interior woodwork, panelling, fittings... closets cedar-lined. Porches on two sides, shrubbery and fine trees. This is a very unusual property and will be keenly appreciated by a family seeking a modern home where personal attention has been exercised to secure the very best in quality throughout all details of construction, finish, convenience and good taste."⁵ Albert C. Barnes purchased the property in 1924, and sold the property in 1942 to Ludwig Merz.

1929

South Elevation

The exterior of the Renaissance Revival house is Roman brick with a second floor copper bay window, third floor arched windows, and a single copper ocular dormer window. The bay window and ocular dormer window have a copper patina finish. Other significant architectural features include a stone base and stone fence, an iron gate, stone quoins, and a stone columned porch with paired Roman Doric columns (Figures 2 and 3).

¹ David Brownlee, Ph.D., telephone interview by author.

²"Real Estate Transfers." *The Philadelphia Inquirer*, June 9, 1904.

³ Ibid.

⁴ "The Latest News in Real Estate." *The Philadelphia Inquirer*, August 15, 1904.

⁵ "Obituary: Francis J. Hill." *The Philadelphia Inquirer*, November 3, 1923; "Real Estate for Sale." *The Philadelphia Inquirer*, February 12, 1924.



Figure 2. Spruce Street front façade. Source: CycloMedia, 7/2/2017.



Figure 3. 4525 Spruce Street, shown with its neighbors at 4529-33 and 4537 Spruce Street. Source: CycloMedia, 7/2/2017.

East Elevation

The front porch wraps around and extends about halfway along the east side of the property (Figure 4). This side of the building is visible on Melville Street because of its location on the corner. It is also where the front door is located, accessible from the porch. Similar to the south elevation, the style of the windows differ on each of the three floors. Delicate floral stained glass window designs decorate the second and third floor windows about the roofed porch.



Figure 4. Melville Street side elevation. Source: CycloMedia, 7/2/2017.

North Elevation

The north elevation of the building overlooks a small, grassy backyard area (Figure 5). As this side is hidden from street view, the north elevation features less decoration than the south and east sides of the building. The windows overlooking the backyard are uniformly rectangular and in registers of two on each of the three floors.



Figure 5. Rear of 4525 Spruce Street, as seen from Melville Street. Source: CycloMedia, 7/2/2017.

West Elevation

The west elevation is obscured by the proximity of the neighboring building.

Charles McCaul, contractor and builder

Charles McCaul (fl. ca. 1890-1907), the builder of the property under consideration in this nomination, was a prominent and admired Philadelphia builder in the late nineteenth and early twentieth century. He held an office at 10 N. 11th Street in Philadelphia. His contributions to the city as a contractor and builder include schools, institutions, banks, factories, breweries, prisons, residences, powerhouses and car barns, store and office buildings (Figure 8), and hotels.⁶

McCaul's most important projects in the city of Philadelphia include the Drexel Institute of Technology Main Building (3101 Chestnut Street; Figure 6), Reading Terminal Market and Train Shed (Figure 7), and the United States Mint building that is now a part of the Community College of Philadelphia. These three specific examples of McCaul's work are included in the Historic American Building Survey and the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. His work on the Reading Terminal Station building was also recorded on the Historic American Engineering Record and the National Register of Historic Buildings. The Drexel Institute of Technology is also on the National Register.



Figure 6. The Drexel Institute of Technology (main building) 3101 Chestnut Street. Builder: Charles McCaul. Source: King, Moses. *Philadelphia and Notable Philadelphia*. (New York: Blanchard Press, Isaac H. Blanchard Co., 1901), p. 24d.

⁶ Tatman, Sandra L. "McCaul, Charles M., 2d (fl. 1890 - 1910)." Philadelphia Architects and Buildings.



Figure 7. Reading Terminal Station and Train Shed. Builder: Charles McCaul. Source: The Official Office Building Directory and Architectural Handbook of Philadelphia, The Commercial Publishing and Directory Co., Philadelphia, 1899, p. 534.



Figure 8. Land Title Building, 100-118 S. Broad Street/ Lafayette Hotel. Builder: Charles McCaul. Source: King, Moses. *Philadelphia and Notable Philadelphia*. (New York: Blanchard Press, Isaac H. Blanchard Co., 1901), p. 14.



Figure 9. Front gate at entrance to property on Spruce Street. Source: Corey Loftus.



Figure 10. Melville Street side of the porch. Source: Corey Loftus.



Figure 11. Window details at second and third floors on Melville Street side. Source: Corey Loftus.



Figure 12. Bay detail on Melville Street side. Source: Corey Loftus.



Figure 13. Iron gate at front entrance on Spruce Street. Source: Corey Loftus.

Section 7: Statement of Significance

The property at 4525 Spruce Street merits designation by the Philadelphia Historical Commission and inclusion on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The property is associated with the life of Philadelphia's own treasured art collector and educator, Albert C. Barnes (1872-1951). Barnes purchased and remodeled the residence to use as the external publication and administrative office of the chartered Foundation in Merion from 1929 to 1942.

4525 Spruce Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A and B, as set forth in Section 14-1004 of the Philadelphia Code:

(A) Has significant character, interest, or value as part of the development, heritage or cultural characteristics of the City, Commonwealth, or Nation or is associated with the life of a person significant in the past.

The property at 4525 Spruce Street is associated with the life and work of famous chemist, art collector, and founder of the Barnes Foundation, Albert Coombs Barnes (1872-1951). Barnes, a graduate of Central High School and medical school at the University of Pennsylvania was born of an Irish, working class, Methodist family in Philadelphia in 1872. English The self-made millionaire purchased the property in 1929 and remodeled it to serve as the

administrative publishing center for the educational institution based in Merion. The West Philadelphia location provided easy access for employees commuting from Philadelphia. This was also the location that Barnes could receive business and institutional partners for meetings. Another reason why Barnes acquired the property was because the publishing center could administrative not be accommodated in the Merion mansion and he would not build another structure on the property that would interfere with wife, Laura Barnes', horticultural school that took place throughout the arboretum on the same property.⁷, beginning in 1940.

> Barnes' collection boasts impressionist, post-impressionist, early modern and old master paintings as well at Native American fine crafts, African sculpture, and early American furniture and decorative art. The foundation (founded 1922) was moved from its original location in Merion (a Paul Cret-designed suburban mansion) to the Tod Williams Billie Tsien Architects' state-of-the-art building on the Benjamin Franklin Parkway in 2012 where Barnes' educational legacy has been extended to reach a larger audience, and his commitment to arts education has been realized in an expansion of programming as a result of the move to a larger and more accessible space. Barnes' impressive collection is internationally recognized as one of the world's most important holdings of impressionist and post-impressionist art. The office at 4525 Spruce Street served as an outpost during the early years of the Foundation's development where publishing and administrative tasks were executed.

⁷ Mary Ann. Meyers, *Art, Education, & African-American Culture: Albert Barnes and the Science of Philanthropy* (Transaction Publishers, 2006).

(B) Is associated with an event of importance to the history of the City, Commonwealth or Nation.

The building at 4525 Spruce Street is associated with an important lawsuit between Albert Barnes and the City of Philadelphia. In 1930, Albert Barnes went to court against the Receiver of Taxes and the Board of Revision of Taxes for taxing his Spruce Street property. He lost the case in 1931, but four years later, in 1934, had the decision reversed by the Supreme Court of Pennsylvania. The trial is a significant event because Barnes considered the tax exemption of the Spruce Street property a legitimization of the Foundation's educational experiment. Not only is the dispute of historical importance to the history of the Barnes Foundation, but also to the history of the City and State in the way that it demonstrates Pennsylvania's recognition of the educational mission of the Foundation.⁸

In March of 1930, the City of Philadelphia taxed Barnes' property at 4525 Spruce with a total of \$756 for school and property taxes. The city claimed that the property appeared more like a residence and could not be considered an extension of the Merion-located property. Barnes, upon returning from a trip with John Dewey, was outraged to find the note. He took the case to court with lawyer Robert T. McCracken to settle the dispute on the matter of principle. (McCracken was a prominent Philadelphia attorney at the time who was employed by Roberts, Montgomery, & McKeehan, founded in 1912 by three lawyers including laterappointed Supreme Court Justice, Owen Roberts).⁹

During the trial, Barnes detailed his use of the interior spaces as follows: the basement was for book storage and shipment; the first floor was used as a reception area with a mailroom, workroom, and employee-used kitchenette; the second floor housed offices for his employees including art instructor, Violette de Mazia's office; the third floor housed the president's office and suite.¹⁰

A number of notable employees, friends, and scholars testified in support of Barnes's claim. The list includes educational reformer and philosopher, John Dewey, Barnes's wife, Laura, employee Nelle Mullen, students, Herbert Jennings and Laura Grieger, and teacher, Violette de Mazia. Philosopher Dr. Lawrence Buermeyer also testified. When Buermeyer was a graduate student at the University of Princeton University Pennsylvania, he was hired to tutor Barnes in Philosophy and Aesthetics. Buermeyer visited the Merion location 3 afternoons a week to read and discuss William James with Barnes. When he moved to Princeton to pursue a PhD at Princeton University, the two stayed in contact and Buermeyer continued to advise Barnes when Barnes began publishing about his educational approach.¹¹

 ⁸ Meyers, Art, Education, & African-American Culture: Albert Barnes and the Science of Philanthropy.
 ⁹ Barnes, Albert C. Received by John Dewey, 19 Sept. 1930.

¹⁰ Meyers, Art, Education, & African-American Culture: Albert Barnes and the Science of Philanthropy. ¹¹ Ibid.

Appendix A: Important Documents and Evidence Related to the Above Assertions

Two records from the Correspondences of John Dewey. Letters from Albert Barnes to colleague and friend, John Dewey, in 1930 regarding the lawsuit over 4525 Spruce Street property. (Available online: http://www.nlx.com/collections/132) The Correspondence of John Dewey, 1871-2007 (I-IV). Electronic Edition.

1930.09.19 (04266): Albert C. Barnes to John Dewey

4525 Spruce Street, | Philadelphia, Pa., | September 19th. 1930,

Dear Jack:-

I am in a big hole over here with the School authorities working through the instrumentality of the crib-feeding politicians. They are trying to make me pay a Municipal tax on our new office building [4525 Spruce Street], which was necessitated by our abandoning the old laboratory on 40th. Street. As you know all of our books were written in that old business building. Naturally when we left we had to have a place to continue that work and thats what we have been doing at Fortieth Street ever since.

Now I want to lick those bastards and lick them right and only a few words from you on the stand will settle for all time the question of whether we are an educational institution or that antequated Broome bunch.

The trial comes up on Tuesday, September 30th. and I am going to ask you to be at my house on Monday night, so that you can go on the stand and tell in about five minutes what we are and what we stand for.¹ I am making no attack on the School system and shall not refer to them, unless they reproach me for not co-operating with them. If they do, the quarrel is with you, because you passed on that evidence as it was furnished to you as the result of Buermyers experience with their teachers.

Bring enough things with you to stay a few days, so that we can clean up the matter of the objective phases of the philosophy of Art which you have asked me to help you with.

Yours sincerely, | [Albert C. Barnes]

¹ See "Foundation Fights Tax | A. C. Barnes Protests City Levy on Property in Suit," *Philadelphia Inquirer*, 1 Oct. 1930, 3. Barnes claimed that the foundation's city office at 4525 Spruce St., Philadelphia, should be tax-exempt because the purpose of the foundation was "for the advancement of education and the appreciation of the fine arts." City taxation officials countered that this property, separated from the main tract on which the educational institute was located, was not entitled to exemption. Decision was deferred.

1930.09.19 (04268): Albert C. Barnes to John Dewey

September 19, 1930. | Second note.

Dear Jack:

I dictated hurriedly what I sent to you earlier today and it may mislead as to the real question. Under the law, our office building [4525 Spruce Street] is entitled to tax exemption. Somehow or other, the school authorities got wind of the matter and it is their attorney who is conducting the case against us. Owen Roberts, before he went on the U. S. Supreme Court bench, advised me to fight them in the Courts.¹

What I want you to say on the stand is merely what we stand for in the art-educational world—I don't ask you to say anything attacking the school system. If they, of their own volition, bring up the question of our relation to the school system, we shall put in testimony Buermeyer's report on his experience in trying to train the teachers. You saw the report and so did Broome and it speaks for itself. Legally, my lawyers say, the city hasn't a leg to stand on and there must be something back of it. The fact that it is the attorney for the school board who is attacking us, <u>and through the Courts</u>, shows what that something is.

I did not ask you to mix in it until my attorney said we must have testimony of somebody in the educational world to express an opinion of our status. He asked "Could you get John Dewey to tell what he knows of your work?" and I said I would ask you. It's the last straw when the educational system of a big city plays small politics to vent their spite.

Sincerely, | [Albert C. Barnes]

¹ After serving as professor of law at the Univ. of Pennsylvania 1898-1918, Owen Josephus Roberts (1875-1955) during the 1920s was director of City Trusts and of several other corporations in Philadelphia. He was an associate justice of the U.S. Supreme Court 1930-45. In 1946 Roberts was chairman of the U.S. commission for the protection and salvage of artistic and historic monuments in war areas. He was coauthor of *The New Federalist* (1950) and author of *The Court and the Constitution* (1951).



Figure 14. Newspaper clipping regarding Barnes' lawsuit with the city over the property at 4525 Spruce Street. Source: *Philadelphia Inquirer*, February 1, 1934.

Appendix A: Newspaper Clippings

nu square B and L Asso to Thos A Ciair; June 6. '04; 16x66; g r \$150.... Spruce and Melville sts. N W cor-Frank Nom om S Elliot to Francis J Hill: June 6. '04: om 45x135 6.000 Sigel st. 103 to 113 incl; ea 15x42.6: Sigel st. 123. 15x42 6_Chris I Cooke

Figure 15. Sale of lot at Spruce and Melville Streets from Frank Elliot to Francis J. Hill. Source: Philadelphia Inquirer, June 9, 1904.

TI Architect and Engineer M. H. Dickinson, 2d. will send plans to general contractors for esti-T mates, on August 18, for Frank Hill's new resito be built at Spruce and Melville dence. The dwelling will be built of stone, TI streets. three stories high, to measure 23.10 by 65.4 1,feet, and it will contain fourteen rooms. ts. T er

Figure 16. Mention of Frank Hill's new residence, with plans by architect and engineer M.H. Dickinson. Source: Philadelphia Inquirer, August 15, 1904.

Permits Issued on Saturday

McCarty & Witman, four-story and basement addition, 18x45 feet, and fire-escape, 1720 N 5th st, for H H Sheip & Co: cost \$4200.

August Wurst, repair walls, 1112 N American st, for M Gimbel: cost \$300.

Warren E Biscoe, third-story bath room, 6x10 feet, 503 Woodland Terrace, for J Ellison cost \$425; and frame shed, 7x14 feet, 518 Reed st. for ---- Fetterman: cost \$75. Davis & Huston, temporary frame sta

stand.

12x20 feet, for mass meeting, 1707 S Broad st, for the East End Republican Club; cost \$75. Wilkey Brothers, second-story bath room, 6x10 feet, and reweatherboard kitchen, 7321 Claridge st, for ——— Gustermire; cost \$370. Samuel Cramer, two-story front addition, 23x

70 feet, to school and dwelling, north side of Fletcher st, east of 28th, for Samuel C Blair; cost \$2400.

The Charles McCaul Company, three-story brick dwelling, 23x60.1 feet, N W cor of Spruce and Melville sts. for Francis J Hill: cost \$10,-000: M H Dickinson, architect; hot water heat. James J Quigley & Son, heating apparatus, 647 N 16th st. for Miss Buck: cost \$150: 504

Figure 17. Mention of permits issued to the Charles McCaul Company for the three-story brick dwelling for Francis J. Hill. M.H. Dickinson is the architect. Source: Philadelphia Inquirer, October 9, 1905.

*

7



Figure 18. Obituary for Francis J. Hill, the original owner of 4525 Spruce Street. The obituary notes his membership in the Manufacturer's Club, the local lodge of Elks, Knights of Columbus, and the Friendly Sons of Saint Patrick. Source: *Philadelphia Inquirer*, November 3, 1923.

4525 SPR Beautiful detached corner residence. 3 stories Built by Charles Lot 45x135. and basement. McCall & Co. under owner's supervision. welve rooms, electric light, hot-water heat. convenience. every possible modern interior woodwork, panelling. fittings. Bolid obtained closets today. be not could etc.. on two sides. shrubbery Porches lined. cedar and fine trees. This is a very unusual proporty and will be keenly appreciated by a family where personal attenseeking a modern home. the very secure exercised to been has tion in quality throughout all details of conbest finish, convenience and good taste. struction. HORACE H. FRITZ. street. 713 Walnut

Figure 19. Real estate listing of 4525 Spruce property after Hill's death. Source: *Philadelphia Inquirer*, February 12, 1924.

Section 8: Major Bibliographical References

- Denhoff, Erica, and Kim Franklin. "West Philadelphia: The Basic History." West Philadelphia Community History Center. Accessed March 10, 2018. http://www.archives.upenn.edu/histy/features/wphila/history/history2.html.
- "Elliott Residence." Philadelphia Architects and Buildings. https://www.philadelphiabuildings.org/pab/app/pj_display.cfm/83584.
- Meyers, Mary Ann. Art, Education, & African-American Culture: Albert Barnes and the Science of Philanthropy. Piscataway, NJ: Transaction Publishers, 2006.
- "National Register District Inventory for Spruce Street." University City Historical Society. http://uchs.net/HistoricDistricts/inventories-html/spruce.html.
- Nichols, Thom. *Philadelphia Architecture*. Images of America. Charleston, SC: Arcadia, 2005.
- Skaler, Robert Morris. *Images of America: West Philadelphia University City to 52nd Street*. Charleston, SC: Arcadia, 2002.
- Tang, Vivienne. "In West Philly, Finding The Source Of Barnes' Fortune." Hidden Philadelphia. March 6, 2018. https://hiddencityphila.org/2013/03/in-west-philly-finding-the-source-of-barnes-fortune/.
- Tatman, Sandra L. "Dickinson, Mahlon H., 2d (fl. 1891 1929)." Philadelphia Architects and Buildings.
- Tatman, Sandra L. "McCaul, Charles M., 2d (fl. 1890 1910)." Philadelphia Architects and Buildings.
- "West Philadelphia Streetcar Suburb Historic District." University City Historical Society. Accessed March 10, 2018. http://uchs.net/HistoricDistricts/wpsshd.html.