

**CITY OF PHILADELPHIA
DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC HEALTH
BOARD OF HEALTH MEETING**

FEBRUARY 18, 2010

A meeting of the Philadelphia Board of Health was held on Thursday, February 18, 2010, in the Municipal Services Building, 1401 J.F.K. Boulevard, Room 1450.

Board Members Present: Jose A. Benitez, MSW; Shannon P. Marquez, MEng, PhD; Scott McNeal, DO; Susan Schewel, CRNP, PhD; Donald F. Schwarz, MD, MPH; Robert G. Sharrar, MD, MSc; Yolanda A. Slaughter, DDS, MPH

Attendees: Susan Boland; Jerry Bowman; Peter J. Carroll; Sean Connolly; Reginald Crabbe; Renee Dempsey; Sylvia Dove; Nan Feyler; Judy Gelinias; Kay Graham; John Hawkins; Caroline Johnson, MD; Freya Koss; Giridhar Mallya, MD, MSHP; Luke McConnell; Andrew Miramor; Jeff Moran; Bob Reeves; Alan Roberson; Clayton Ruley; Leslie Smith; Elaine Strunk; Kevin Vaughan; David Tekosky

Welcome and Introductions

Board President Dr. Donald Schwarz, Health Commissioner, called the meeting to order at 5:35 PM. He welcomed the members of the Board and those attending the meeting. Dr. Schwarz asked for amendments or corrections to the minutes of the meeting of December 10, 2009. Dr. Sharrar noted factual inaccuracies in the record of discussion pertaining to the efficacy of HPV vaccine. The statements have been reviewed and corrected.

Influenza Update

Dr. Schwarz introduced Dr. Caroline Johnson, Director of the Division of Disease Control, to provide the Board with an update on immunization against H1N1 and seasonal influenza.

Dr. Johnson reported that demand for seasonal flu vaccine has been much greater this season, with community based influenza immunization clinics administering nearly twice as many doses of vaccine this year over last. She speculated that the late arrival of H1N1 vaccine caused many people to opt for the seasonal vaccine, which was immediately available. 55,000 doses of seasonal vaccine have been administered through City health centers and the health department's community based program. An additional 110,000 doses have been distributed through the Vaccines for Children program. Very little seasonal influenza activity has been detected this year.

When H1N1 vaccine became available in late October, the Division of Disease focused on immunizing children. Immunization was provided in 100% of public and Catholic schools, 90% of private schools, and 70% of charter schools. Between 60,000 and 65,000 young people were immunized through the school-based effort.

At the beginning of 2010, eligibility was extended to older people and others who wanted the vaccine. In Philadelphia 450,000 doses have been distributed. The Department's influenza immunization advertising campaign concludes on March 1.

Dr. Johnson cautioned that there is still a potential for a third wave H1N1 influenza. For the next flu season, there will not be two vaccines. The trivalent seasonal influenza vaccine will include immunization against H1N1.

Dental Amalgam Review:

The Board of Health conducted its annual scientific review of amalgam as decided during the February 10, 2009 Board meeting.

The Board invited the three parties named in the amalgam ordinance—Consumers for Dental Choice, the Philadelphia County Dental Society, and the New Era Dental Society—to submit:

- Five or fewer scientific articles and/or reports published since January 1, 2009, that provide new evidence about amalgam, dental health, and overall health.
- A copy of the Information Sheet with any suggested changes noted and the basis for change clearly cited.
- Written testimony from one or two organization representatives that summarizes the suggested changes to the Information Sheet and the rationale for the changes.

The Philadelphia County Dental Society submitted the following reports or articles:

--FDA Final Rule and Guidance Document on Dental Amalgam, Mercury, and Amalgam Alloy

--A position paper by Steven R. Jefferies, MS, DDS, PhD, Director of Clinical Research, Kornberg School of Dentistry, Temple University

Consumers for Dental Health submitted the following reports or articles:

--Linking mercury amalgam to autoimmunity, Paolo D. Pigatto and Gianpaolo Guzzi

--Assessment of chronic mercury exposure within the U.S. population, National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey, 1999-2006, Dan R. Links, Springer Science and Business Media, published online August 21, 2009.

--A prospective study of prenatal mercury exposure from maternal dental amalgams and autism severity, David A. Geier, Janet K. Kern, Mark R. Geier, Acta Neurobiol Exp 2-009, 69: 1-9

--Affidavit: An Evaluation of Dental Amalgam and its Ability To Injure Human Health, Boyd E. Haley, PhD, February 2, 2010..

--Cadmium, mercury, and lead in kidney cortex of living kidney donors: Impact of different exposure sources, Barregard, L. et al, Environ. Res. (2009), doi: 10.1016/j.envres.2009.10.010

Dr. Peter Carroll, D.D.S, President of the Philadelphia County Dental Society, Dental Society, addressed the Board and presented written testimony including recommended changes in the dental amalgam information sheet (**attachment A**).

Dr. Carroll called upon Dr. Andrew Miramor to discuss his experiences with special needs children at an outpatient facility for patients with intellectual or developmental disabilities that often require general anesthesia for treatment. Dr. Miramor said that that the option of using amalgam is essential in these circumstances and obtaining a parental signature on the information fact sheet can be challenging. He said that he is usually able to provide clarification to a parent, but some parents refuse, which necessitates that they seek treatment elsewhere.

Dr. Schwarz noted that while the regulation and ordinance require that the fact sheet be presented they do not preclude the use of other additional, informational materials.

Renee Fennell-Dempsey, D.M.D., President of the New Era Dental Society, addressed the Board, endorsed the changes to the dental amalgam information sheet, and submitted written testimony (**attachment B**).

Dr. Yolanda Slaughter asked if the Dental Society had used a particular method in gathering information about the impact of the regulation and patient response to the information sheet, or if the information is anecdotal. Dr. Carroll said that the information is anecdotal.

Robert Reeves, Esquire, representing Consumers for Dental Choice, addressed the Board and presented written testimony including recommended changes in the dental amalgam information sheet (**attachment C**).

Susan Schewel, asked Ms. Koss for opinion of the FDA's Final Rule and Guidance on Dental Amalgam. Ms. Koss said that she is disappointed in the decision but has reason for optimism. She referred the question to Robert Reeves who reviewed for the Board his recent discussions with Dr. Joshua Sharfstein and other FDA officials under the Obama administration. He said there is reason to believe that the Final Rule and guidance will change under the new administration in Washington and urged the Commissioner to further investigate the matter.

Dr. Robert Sharrar commented that the Board must act on what is said officially by the FDA, not reports on what is being said behind the scenes.

Dr. Schwarz indicated that he would consult with the FDA prior to the next meeting of the Board.

Human Papilloma Virus (HPV):

Dr. Giridhar Mallya, Department of Public Health Director of Policy and Planning, presented the Board with information requested during the meeting of December 10, 2009:

- An article, Health and Economic Implications of HPV Vaccination in the United States, Jane J. Kim, PhD. and Sue J. Goldie, M., MPH; New England Journal of Medicine, August 21, 2008; which discusses the cost effectiveness of the vaccine and concludes that the vaccine is cost effective dependent upon the percentage of young women immunized, length of immunity, whether or not the vaccine protect against genital warts, and the frequency of pap smear screening.

-An article, Will Widespread Human Papillomavirus Prophylactic Vaccination Change Sexual Practices of Adolescent and Young Adult Women in America; Bradley J. Monk, MD, and Dorothy J. Wiley, PhD, MPH; Obstetrics & Gynecology, Vol. 109, No. 2; August 2006; which examines the impact of sexually transmitted disease interventions on sexual behavior. Because HPV specific data is unavailable the authors review the effects of condom distribution and Hepatitis B immunization upon behavior. Between 1991 and 2001 American girls reported a decline in sexual encounters, fewer sexual partners, and among the sexually active, more frequent use of condoms.

-An Amendment to Regulations Governing the Immunization and Treatment of Newborns, Children, and Adolescents, to serve as an example or model for proposed regulations.

Further discussion of a regulation governing HPV immunization was postponed for a future meeting.

Announcements: Dr. Schwarz announced that the Mayor would present his budget to City Council on March 4th. He said that the State budget has reduced funding for HIV-AIDS services by 1.7 million primarily impacting counseling and youth services.

The Commissioner adjourned the meeting at 6:50 PM.