

PHILADELPHIA CITY PLANNING COMMISSION
October 19, 2010

PRESENT:

Alan Greenberger, Chairman
Joseph Syrnick, Vice Chairman
Brian Abernathy, representing Richard Negrin
Patrick J. Eiding
Bernard Lee, Esq.
Nancy Rogo Trainer
Nilda Ruiz
Anna Wallace Adams, representing Rob Dubow

ABSENT:

Executive Director:

Gary J. Jastrzab

Chairman Alan Greenberger convened the City Planning Commission Meeting of October 19, 2010 at 1:04pm.

- 1) Approval of the Minutes for the September 21, 2010 meeting.

Upon motion by Mr. Syrnick, the City Planning Commission approved the minutes for the September 21, 2010 meeting.

- 2) Executive Director's Update

Mr. Jastrzab introduced the following new staff members: Stephen Giorgio (Urban Design), Mark Wheeler (Strategic Planning and Policy), Jeannette Brugger (Strategic Planning and Policy), Matt Wysong (Community Planning), and Ian Litwin (Community Planning).

- **BUSINESS JOURNAL ANNOUNCES 2010 WOMEN OF DISTINCTION WINNERS**

The Business Journal announced Nancy Rogo Trainer of Venturi, Scott Brown & Associates as one of the 2010 Women of Distinction winners. A panel of 12 external judges selected winners, with scores based on professional accomplishments, community involvement and awards/milestones. Winners will be publicly recognized at an awards banquet on Tuesday, November 30 from 5:30-8:30 p.m. at the Sheraton City Center Hotel and profiled in the Philadelphia Business Journal.

- **Zoning Code Commission**

The Zoning Code Commission has conducted several public outreach meetings and will be conducting several more meetings until the first part of November.

- **Philadelphia 2035**

City Council was briefed on the Philadelphia 2035 Plan on 9/30. We have scheduled public meeting at the following locations:

- 10/25 Moore College of Art and Design (CC)
- 10/26 Mummer's Museum (South)
- 11/8 Richmond Hall (North)
- 11/10 Commodore Barry Club (NW)

- **Citizens Planning Institute**

Applications have been received, and students accepted for classes scheduled at Community College of Philadelphia for November 4, November 11, and November 18.

- **Item in Accord with Previous Policy:**

1. **Redevelopment Agreement with Temple University for 2106 N. Broad Street.**

Future development of academic and mixed-use facilities at 2100-06 N. Broad, on a site

that includes other properties to be acquired privately by Temple. This is in accord with the North Philadelphia Redevelopment Area Plan.

2. **Urban Renewal Plan Amendments for 1701 Vine Street, the site for the proposed Mormon Temple.** Last month, the Commission approved a Redevelopment Area Plan amendment to permit institutional land use on this site. These new and very minor Urban Renewal Plan changes are consistent with the Commission's prior approval.

- 3) Presentation of the American Planning Association "Great Public Spaces" Award for Rittenhouse Square.

David Schaaf, Division Director of the Urban Design Division, stated the American Planning Association Award for Rittenhouse Square, as one of the ten "Great Public Spaces in America." Each year, the American Planning Association's (APA) "Great Places in America" Program recognizes the importance of 10 Great Public Spaces, 10 Great Streets, and 10 Great Neighborhoods in the United States. Through this program, the APA celebrates places of exceptional character, beauty, and planning in this country. Earlier this year, the City Planning Commission staff nominated Rittenhouse Square for a "Great Public Spaces" award, recognizing its characteristics as a preeminent urban place and neighborhood crossroads. Two previous PCPC nominations for "Great Places in America" were awarded to the City of Philadelphia by the APA. In 2008, Society Hill was named a "Great Neighborhood," and the Avenue of the Arts/South Broad Street was named a "Great Street."

- 4) Philadelphia2035 Plan Update.

Alan Greenberger gave the update for the Philadelphia2035 Plan.

- 5) Presentation of the *Philadelphia Pedestrian and Bicycle Plan*.

Deborah Schaaf, Planner with the Strategic Planning and Policy, stated this plan is Philadelphia's first Pedestrian Plan, and it serves as an update to the City's Bicycle Network Plan, completed in 2000. By 2009, more than 200 miles of City streets had received bike lanes. The new bike lanes, together with the expansion of the Schuylkill River Trail, have helped to support a significant growth of bicycling in recent years. However, certain areas of the City were never well covered due to physical constraints of the narrow streets and the many demands on them. The study area for this phase of the plan includes the areas of the City with the most pressing issues relating to the bicycle and pedestrian networks. The plan also includes citywide policy recommendations. The study was commissioned by the City of Philadelphia and managed by the Philadelphia City Planning Commission. The project was funded by a grant from the Delaware Valley Regional Planning Commission's Transportation and Community Development Initiative. The consultant team was led by Toole Design Group, together with Campbell Thomas & Company and MFR Consultants.

Comments were made by Alex Doty of the Bicycle Coalition of Greater Philadelphia.

- 6) *Information Only: Development Proposal for an Entertainment Venue, 2055 Richmond Street (Presented by David Grasso, Grasso Holdings).*

Larissa Klevan gave a brief introduction on the proposal.

Ron Patterson, attorney for Grasso Holdings, confirmed Alan Greenberger's statement that an ordinance was not introduced for this item.

- 7) Institutional Development District Master Plan Amendment for Holy Family University to construct a new administrative building.

Martin Gregorski, Development Planning Division and Acting IDD Administrator, stated this IDD amendment would permit the construction of a new office building, generally in the footprint of the existing Marian Hall, a 2 ½-story, 7,000 sq. ft. residential structure situated on a 1 ½ acre lot. The proposed Marian Hall will contain approximately 12,740 square feet of office space in a 2-story structure with off-street parking for 39 vehicles. The new Marian Hall is necessary to meet the administrative needs of the growing IDD. The building will house administrative functions, some executive staff, the University's Board of Trustees, offices, conference rooms, and a multi-purpose room; which will be used for office assembly space. The new structure will displace some existing parking, with a net increase of parking of 29 spaces. Planning Commission staff recommendation is approval.

Comments were made by Peter Santella, representing Holy Family University.

Upon motion by Mr. Syrnick, seconded by Mr. Eiding, the City Planning Commission approved the Institutional Development District Master Plan Amendment for Holy Family University to construct a new administrative building.

- 8) Zoning Bill No. 100498: Amending Chapter 14-1600 of the Philadelphia Zoning Code by adding a new Section establishing the "Roxborough Environmental Control District" (Introduced by Councilmember Jones on May 17, 2010).

Paula Brumbelow, Development Planning Division, stated this Bill covers the properties known generally as Manatawna Farms in the Shawmont Valley section of the City. The properties are bounded by Hagy's Mill Road, Cathedral Road, the Schuylkill River and the Philadelphia County border and is approximately 76 acres in site with 50 acres dedicated to farming, community gardening, hay raising and animal husbandry. The purpose of this Bill is to create a new Section, which will establish the Roxborough Environmental Control District. This district will encompass the Manatawna Farms as a wildlife habitat that will protect the fragile grasslands that provide open space for migratory songbirds, and ensure that the serpentine rock formations are not built upon. It is claimed that the five hundred garden plots currently located on the property have damaged the ecological integrity of the area with invasive plant species, animal pests and storm water runoff. It is believed that further development of five acres for a total of 10 commercial farm plots would have a devastating effect upon the environmental integrity of the area. The Bill will include the entire land area identified as Parcel 1 in Bill No. 263 approved on December 31, 1984. The Bill will prohibit the following uses:

- a) Commercial uses, including but not limited to commercial farming, with the exception of commercial farming on plots within the footprint of the existing community gardens;

- b) Any increase in the size of the community gardens beyond the existing boundaries of such gardens as set forth in subsection (3)(a);
- c) Any development on the grasslands or division of the grasslands with fencing of any kind or in any other manner; or
- d) Any use which reduces the size of the wildlife habitat.

Manatawna Farm is currently utilized by two entities: Saul High School of Philadelphia and the Schuylkill Center for Environmental Education. Saul High School mainly uses the property to grow hay for its animal husbandry program and to provide support for the 4-H program and animals. The Schuylkill Center for Environmental Education manages the on-site community gardens. The City of Philadelphia Department of Parks and Recreation advertised a Request for Information (RFI) for Management and Operation of Commercial, Chemical-Free Farming at Manatawna Farms on March 19, 2010. The RFI stated, that this program will provide farmers more land than is traditionally available in the City for growing crops. Planning Commission staff recommendation is disapproval.

Public Comments were made by the following people: Joan Blaustein representing Parks & Recreation; David O'Neill, abutting property owner; Mark Focht representing Parks & Recreation; and Ellen Tichner, adjacent property owner.

Upon motion by Mr. Abernathy, seconded by Ms. Ruiz, the City Planning Commission disapproved Zoning Bill No. 100498.

Mr. Lee voted against the motion.

- 9) Zoning Bill No. 100552: Rezoning a parcel of land located within an area bounded by 4th, 5th, Race, and Florist Streets, and amending the "C-3" Commercial classification in the Zoning Code (Introduced by Councilmember DiCicco on October 16, 2010).

Ms. Brumbelow stated the applicant is proposing a building that will be 261,761 square feet and 131 feet tall, mixed use building. The proposed project will consist of 150 hotel rooms, up to 35,000 square feet of retail use and will provide 277 on-site parking spaces.

The first part of the Bill will change the zoning of the property from "L-4" Industrial to "C-3 Commercial.

The second part of the Bill will amend Section 14-303 by permitting the following uses:

- One hotel and not more than three restaurants and one accessory bowling alley or similar entertainment venues, with a maximum of three Pennsylvania Liquor Control Board licenses.
- The permitted principal restaurant and entertainment uses may occupy a maximum of 35,000 square feet.
- The permitted principal restaurant and entertainment uses will have zoning use permits cease after two years of permanent closing or abandonment.
- No gaming of any category will be permitted.
- Live entertainment of guests will be permitted.
- Dancing by patrons will be permitted on an accessory dance floor that does not exceed 10% of the floor area of the principal restaurant and entertainment use.

The following regulations will amend to Section 14-303 by allowing the following zoning regulations:

- A maximum height of 145 feet will be set in place for the western side of the property.
- A maximum height of 85 feet will be set in place for the eastern side of the property.
- One loading space shall be required.

The following regulations will amend Section 14-303 for Off Street Parking:

- For hotel use, one space for six single family units.
- For restaurant and entertainment uses, one space for every 450 square feet of gross floor area.
- For residential uses other than hotel uses, one space for every five single-family units.
- All interior parking spaces shall be permitted to be tandem, stacked, and mechanical stacked parking, and comply with all applicable parking requirements.
- All exterior parking spaces shall be permitted to be tandem, stacked, and mechanical stacked parking, and comply with all applicable surface parking lot requirements, including screening, landscaping, lighting and striping.

The following regulations will allow for one non-accessory outdoor advertising sign, which will provide digital display and changeable copy. The sign will be embedded into the east facing the wall of the building at the western portion of the property and have a maximum sign area of 1,200 square feet. This Bill will allow for the development of an under-utilized property and make a gateway entry building for those that enter the City from the Benjamin Franklin Bridge. Planning Commission staff recommendation is approval with technical amendments made by the City Planning Commission staff. The City Planning Commission staff has worked with the applicant to create amended legislation to address the concerns of the staff, applicant and community. We have come up with the following changes:

- Allow the property to have the Old City Special Controls District use qualifications removed.
- Permit a maximum of 35,000 square feet of restaurant, entertainment or public assembly.
- A height maximum of 145 feet along the western portion of the property for the hotel.
- Parking requirements of 1 space for every three hotel units, and 1 space for every 175 square feet of restaurant, entertainment and public assembly uses.
- Remove the billboard as a matter of right.

We feel that this will allow for the project to meet the building envelope as proposed, provide parking for their needs, and provide the majority of uses they are requesting while not having firm agreements with any tenants.

Upon motion by Mr. Eiding, seconded by Mr. Lee, the City Planning Commission approved with technical amendments Zoning Bill No. 100552.

- 10) Zoning Bill No. 100656: Rezoning a parcel of land located within an area bounded by 19th, 20th, Hamilton, and Callowhill Streets, and amending the "C-4" Commercial classification in the Zoning Code (Introduced by Councilmember Clarke on October 7, 2010).

Ms. Brumbelow stated the first part of the Bill will change the zoning of the property from "C-2" Commercial and "G-2" Industrial to "C-4" Commercial. The second part of the Bill will amend Section 14-304 by permitting the following uses in the area bounded by Hamilton Street, 19th Street, Callowhill Street and 20th Street:

- Use Regulations. Accessory parking whether structured or open air is permitted on lot.
- Area Regulations. Legally required windows may be located within 25 feet of the property line.
- Parking. Parking spaces shall be provided at a ratio of one space per every two dwelling units.

This proposal will also have several Streets Department issues that will be addressed in a future Encroachment Ordinance. The applicant will be requesting to permit the allowance of a pedestrian bridge above Shamokin Street, build a canopy and terrace above the sidewalk on Callowhill Street, and install a cluster of four columns on Callowhill Street. This project will consist of approximately 209,000 square feet and will have 174 residential units, 31,000 square feet of retail, 110 parking spaces and 64 bicycle parking spaces. This property will take a vacant lot and the former granary and create a mixed use development that is compatible with the neighborhood just north of the Benjamin Franklin Parkway. Planning Commission staff recommendation is approval with map amendment.

Upon motion by Ms. Ruiz, seconded by Mr. Eiding, the City Planning Commission approved the staff recommendation with map amendment for Zoning Bill No. 100656.

- 11) Streets Bill No. 100546: Repealing Bill No. 090741 (passed by City Council on December 17, 2009), authorizing the relocation of a drainage right-of-way for the Blair Meadows development at 202-216 Shawmont Avenue. The development master plan was originally approved by the City Planning Commission on May 7, 1987, and amended on December 6, 1990 (Introduced by Councilmember Jones on September 16, 2010).

William Erickson, Development Planning Division, stated the purpose of this Bill is to repeal Bill No. 090741, to prevent the construction of the new 8 single-family dwellings. The PCPC approved the RC-6 Master Plan for the construction of 14 new single-family dwellings at this location on May 7, 1987. This was amended on December 6, 1990. Both plans showed units within the rights-of-way that needed to be relocated. Six homes were built by the original developer who later went into bankruptcy. The property was then acquired by the mortgage lender. Planning Commission staff recommendation is disapproval.

Upon motion by Mr. Eiding, seconded by Mr. Syrnick, the City Planning Commission disapproved Streets Bill No. 100546.

Mr. Greenberger adjourned the City Planning Commission Meeting of October 19, 2010 at 4:15pm.

SUMMARY

- 1) Approval of the Minutes of the September 21, 2010 meeting. Approved
- 2) Executive Director's Update.
- 3) Presentation of the American Planning Association "Great Public Spaces" Award for Rittenhouse Square (Presented by David Schaaf). Presented
- 4) Philadelphia2035 Update (Presented by Alan Greenberger) Presented
- 5) Presentation of the *Philadelphia Pedestrian and Bicycle Plan* (Presented by Deborah Schaaf). Presented
- 6) *Information Only: Development Proposal for an Entertainment Venue, 2055 Richmond Street (Presented by David Grasso, Grasso Holdings).* *Presented*
- 7) Institutional Development District Master Plan Amendment for Holy Family University to construct a new administrative building (Presented by Martin Gregorski). Approved
- 8) Zoning Bill #100498: Amending Chapter 14-1600 of the Philadelphia Zoning Code by adding a new Section establishing the "Roxborough Environmental Control District" (Introduced by Councilmember Jones on 5-17-10; Presented by Paula Brumbelow). Disapproved
- 9) Zoning Bill #100552: Rezoning a parcel of land located within an area bounded by 4th, 5th, Race and Florist Streets, and amending the "C-3" Commercial classification (Presented by Paula Brumbelow). Approved with technical amendments
- 10) Zoning Bill #100656: rezoning a parcel of land located within an area bounded by 19th, 20th, Hamilton, and Callowhill Streets, and amending the "C-4" Commercial classification in the Zoning Code (Introduced by Councilmember Clarke on 10-7-10; Presented by Paula Brumbelow). Approved w/map amendment
- 11) Streets Bill #100546: Repealing Bill #090741 (passed by City Council on 12-17-09), authorizing the relocation of a drainage right-of-way for the Blair Meadows development at 202-216 Shawmont Avenue. The development master plan was originally approved by the PCPC on 5/7/87, and amended on 12-6-90 (Introduced by Councilmember Jones on 9-16-10; Presented by William Erickson). Disapproved